

The Centre as Margin

Eccentric Perspectives on Art

Edited by

Joana Antunes

University of Coimbra, Portugal

Maria de Lurdes Craveiro

University of Coimbra, Portugal

Carla Alexandra Gonçalves

Universidade Aberta, Portugal

Series on the History of Art



VERNON PRESS

Copyright © 2019 Vernon Press, an imprint of Vernon Art and Science Inc, on behalf of the author.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Vernon Art and Science Inc.

www.vernonpress.com

In the Americas:
Vernon Press
1000 N West Street,
Suite 1200, Wilmington,
Delaware 19801
United States

In the rest of the world:
Vernon Press
C/Sancti Espiritu 17,
Malaga, 29006
Spain

Series on the History of Art

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018952655

ISBN: 978-1-62273-447-4

Product and company names mentioned in this work are the trademarks of their respective owners. While every care has been taken in preparing this work, neither the authors nor Vernon Art and Science Inc. may be held responsible for any loss or damage caused or alleged to be caused directly or indirectly by the information contained in it.

Every effort has been made to trace all copyright holders, but if any have been inadvertently overlooked the publisher will be pleased to include any necessary credits in any subsequent reprint or edition.

Table of Contents

List of Figures	vii
List of Tables	xi
Introduction: (Re)framing Art History: art beyond boundaries	xiii
Joana Antunes, Maria de Lurdes Craveiro and Carla Alexandra Gonçalves	
PART I	
The Margin at the Centre, or the Centre as Margin	1
Chapter 1 A Liminal Vision Between Dream and the Afterworld in a "Boschian" Painting on the Margin of Hieronymus Bosch	3
Maria José Goulão	
Chapter 2 In the margins of <i>Davidsbündlertänze</i> op. 6 by Robert Schumann	21
Ana Isabel Nistal Freijo	
Chapter 3 Amédée Ozenfant and the peripheries of modernism	37
Jessica Schouela	
Chapter 4 <i>Habeas Corpus</i>. Marginal anatomies at the centre	51
Carla Alexandra Gonçalves	

Chapter 5	Creative marginality as a counter-apparatus, from nonsense to avant-garde	69
	Ricardo Seiça Salgado	
PART II		
	Case Studies on Liminality	91
Chapter 6	The centre and the margin as enhancers of meaning in Celtic literature and art	93
	Beatriz Loureiro	
Chapter 7	<i>Schemes and marginal elements in Romanesque sculpture</i>	115
	Lúcia Rosas	
Chapter 8	An iconographic reading of the tomb of D. Afonso at Braga Cathedral (Portugal)	133
	Ana Cristina Sousa	
Chapter 9	Phoenix, Siren and Sphinx [Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz and the poetic portrait]	159
	Octavio Páez Granados	
Chapter 10	Rethinking the diabolical monster in 18th century salmantine choirstalls	177
	Mariano Casas Hernández	
Chapter 11	Meanings and Strategies for Displaying Human Marvels: Inquiring the iconography of the Double	201
	Paola Pacifici	
Chapter 12	Clio at the Cloister: Re-stitching Mnemosyne	213
	Barbara Margarethe Eggert	

Chapter 13	Resistance, identity, and modernism unhinged in Lygia Pape's textile experiments	231
	Jacqueline Witkowski	
Chapter 14	The margins of patterns, garments and the body	245
	Nuno Nogueira and Inês Simões	
PART III		
	A Place for the Margin	263
Chapter 15	Domestic territories in 15th and 16th century painting	265
	Marta Simões	
Chapter 16	Reading Filarete from the Margin	281
	Berrin Terim	
Chapter 17	The narthex in the architecture of the Portuguese Catholic Reformation, between centrality and liminality	301
	Maria de Lurdes Craveiro	
	Contributors	319
	Index	327

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Follower of Hieronymus Bosch, <i>The Vision of Tondal</i> , ca. 1545 © Fundação M. I. Guerra Junqueiro, Porto, Portugal	9
Figure 2.1 Clara Schumann, “Le Ballet des revenants” op. 5 no. 4	28
Figure 2.2 Clara’s Motifs	30
Figure 2.3 <i>Davidsbündlertänze</i> op 6 no. 1	31
Figure 3.1 Opening image by Marc Allégret in Amédée Ozenfant’s <i>Foundations of Modern Art</i> , 1928 © Ministère de la Culture - Médiathèque du Patrimoine, Dist. RMN-Grand Palais / Marc Allégret	38
Figure 3.2 Photograph of Marc Allégret and André Gide in Amédée Ozenfant’s <i>Foundations of Modern Art</i> , 1928 © Ministère de la Culture - Médiathèque du Patrimoine, Dist. RMN-Grand Palais / Marc Allégret	40
Figure 3.3 Ornamented woman in Ozenfant’s <i>Tour de Grèce</i> , 1938 © ADAGP, Paris and DACS, London 2017	41
Figure 3.4 White woman (Mme Ozenfant?) in Ozenfant’s <i>Tour de Grèce</i> , 1938 © ADAGP, Paris and DACS, London 2017	42
Figure 4.1 Félix Nadar, <i>Hermaphrodite</i> , 1860-61, New York, The Metropolitan Museum, no. 2010.457.1 [CCO – Public domain]	57
Figure 4.2 Félix Nadar, <i>Victor Hugo on His Deathbed</i> , 1885, Woodburytype, Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum. [CCO – Public domain]	61

Figure 6.1 Hunterston brooch. c.700 AD. Gold, silver and amber, diameter 122mm, height 36mm © The National Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh	102
Figure 6.2 Irish Celtic hand-pin. 6th-7th century. Bronze, 22 x 2.2 x 1.9 cm © The Walters Museum, Baltimore	105
Figure 7.1 St. Christopher as <i>Christ Bearer</i> , church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	118
Figure 7.2 St. Christopher grabs his wrist, church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	122
Figure 7.3 Viola player, church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	123
Figure 7.4 Feline in the southern capital of the transverse arch, church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	124
Figure 7.5 Vegetal capital on north façade, church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	125
Figure 7.6 Cartography of sculptural elements at the Church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © João Vieira	128
Figure 7.7 Three characters in a boat, church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau © Mário Cunha	130
Figure 8.1 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (detail of the effigy), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	134
Figure 8.2 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (general view), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	138
Figure 8.3 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (detail of the canopy), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	139
Figure 8.4 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (detail of the decorated panels), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	146
Figure 8.5 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (detail of the decorated panels), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	148
Figures 8.6 and 8.7 Tomb of Prince D. Afonso (details of the motifs used in the panels), Braga Cathedral, Portugal © Ana Cristina Sousa	152

Figure 10.1 Partial view of the choir stalls, Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	180
Figure 10.2 Diabolical monster, misericord, choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	184
Figure 10.3 Vomiting monster, misericord, choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	186
Figure 10.4 Diabolical monster with gaping maw, misericord, choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	189
Figure 10.5 Ox, misericord, choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	192
Figures 10.6 and 10.7 Diabolical “Vultus trifrons” and compound monster, misericords, choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca © Mariano Casas Hernández	194
Figures 11.1 and 11.2 First page and woodcut of the pamphlet dedicated to Ali Agamet, a <i>New Monster found in August 1819</i> (“Narrazione di un Nuovo Mostro Ritrovato nel Mese di Agosto 1819”) © Biagi Collection, Rome	206
Figure 12.1 Goess vestments, antependium, ca. 1239-1269, silk on linen, 106 x 298 cm, MAK – Österreichisches Museum für angewandte Kunst / Gegenwartskunst, T-6902 © MAK/Katrin Wisskirchen	221
Figure 12.2 Goess vestments, chasuble (dorsal view), ca. 1239-1269, silk on linen, 123 x 73 cm, MAK – Österreichisches Museum für angewandte Kunst / Gegenwartskunst, T-6904 © MAK/Ingrid Schindler	225
Figure 12.3 Goess vestments, cope, ca. 1239-1269, silk on linen, 132 x 310 cm, MAK – Österreichisches Museum für angewandte Kunst / Gegenwartskunst Vienna, T-6903 © MAK/Ingrid Schindler	226
Figure 14.1 The tailored jacket block pattern and the two-piece block pattern. Patterns are planned around vertical axes and since usually they are symmetrical, only the right side of the pattern is designed. Diagram adapted by the authors	248

Figure 14.2 Asymmetrical shirt pattern. Because the purpose was to design asymmetrical shirts relative to its vertical axes, the pattern comprises both the right and left side of the torso. Diagram designed by the authors	257
Figure 15.1 The great fire of Bern. Diebold Schilling, <i>Amtliche Berner Chronik</i> , vol. 1. Bern, Burgerbibliothek, Mss.h.h.I.1, 289 © Burgerbibliothek Bern	267
Figure 15.2 Birth scene. <i>Publius Terencius Afer: Comediae</i> , Paris, ca. 1411, Paris, Bibliothèque de l’Arsenal, Ms-664 réserve, fol. 137v © Bibliothèque nationale de France	273
Figure 16.1 <i>Codex Magliabechianus</i> (Ms. II, I,140), 1461-1464, Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, fol. 11v © Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze	288
Figure 16.2 <i>Codex Magliabechianus</i> (Ms. II, I,140), Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, fol. 13v © Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze	292
Figure 16.3 <i>Codex Magliabechianus</i> (Ms. II, I,140), Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, fol. 28r © Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze	294
Figure 16.4 <i>Codex Magliabechianus</i> (Ms. II, I,140), Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, fol. 43r © Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze	296
Figure 17.1 Chapel of Saint Andrew, c. 1500, Beja, Portugal © Maria de Lurdes Craveiro	308
Figure 17.2 Church of Our Lady of Grace, Miguel de Arruda and Nicolau de Chanterene, ca. 1535-1540, Évora, Portugal © Maria de Lurdes Craveiro	310
Figure 17.3 Chapel of Saint Peter, first half of the 17 th century, Beja, Portugal © Maria de Lurdes Craveiro	315

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Motivic relation between “Le ballet des revenants” and the <i>Davidsbündlertänze</i>	28
Table 2.2 Poetic <i>motto</i>	32
Table 2.3 The stage directions	33
Table 2.4 Character indications	33
Table 7.1 Sculpture distribution at the church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau, Portugal. (see the location in the cartography of the sculptural elements)	127
Table 9.1 Gustatory metaphors in Sor Juana’s portrait of Gila	168
Table 9.2 Metaphors and correspondences in Sor Juana’s portrait of Lisarda	172

Introduction: (Re)framing Art History: art beyond boundaries

Joana Antunes, Maria de Lurdes Craveiro
and Carla Alexandra Gonçalves

For disciplines related to Art and Humanities, and concerning Art as an active, and creative process, margins are no longer a place of misfit, nor marginality a condition of exclusion. They have become, in fact, part of the central concerns of a wide range of researchers, thinkers and artists, sometimes far beyond the reach of academies. Borders, boundaries, interstices, places between and beyond, whether strange or contaminated are now, maybe more than ever, physical and mental spaces of a(n) (un)controlled alterity that enhances and privileges new perspectives on unexplored territories, unforeseen protagonists, and themes devoid of the (ever so necessary) status of a dignified study subject. Between the most current objects of desire of contemporary thinkers and researchers, the fluidity and porosity of the contact zones between centre and margin teams up with the allure of ontological uncertainties and epistemological tensions, pulverizing categories and diluting classifications.

With the liminal discourse firmly established as part of the conceptual framework of the Humanities, margins and thresholds became part of the vocabulary of social, cultural, and visual studies alike¹. Without being exclusive of one discipline or another, these terms and the corresponding concepts have definitely entered the art world and Art History's postmodern narrative. Negotiating conflicted situations such as exclusion and inclusion, normalization and transgression, premeditation and spontaneity, the mainstream and counterculture, borders are more than binary actors in the conceptualization of art, particularly if considered, as suggested by Boer to the broader context of cultural phenomena, "not in

¹ One of the most encompassing perspectives on the border or liminal discourse in contemporary culture may be found in Inge Boer, *Uncertain Territories: Boundaries in Cultural Analysis* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2006).

their definition of *what* they are and *where* they are, but instead [...] as a *function*"².

The fertility of these *functional* thresholds, or liminal zones of contact is proven by the multidisciplinary dialogue established between the arts themselves, and between them and any other area of human action³: thus, the visual arts and music⁴, art and media⁵, art and commerce⁶, art and law⁷, art and psychology⁸, art and neurosciences⁹ are among the multiple binomial relations established with or without explicit reference to a liminality as a conceptual framework. Likewise, national and international borders, whether natural or cultural, have been surveyed in order to

² Boer, *Uncertain Territories*, 9.

³ For a recent, multidisciplinary approach see, for instance: Christoph Behnke, Cornelia Kastelan, Valérie Knoli, Ulf Wuggenig, eds., *Art in the Periphery of the Center* (Berlin: Sternberg Press, 2015).

⁴ Peter Vergo is one of the authors who has been crossing the disciplinary boundaries of art history and musical studies to understand the aesthetic, mathematical, conceptual, and philosophical common ground of the arts: Peter Vergo, *That Divine Order. Music and the Visual Arts from Antiquity to the Eighteenth Century* (New York: Phaidon, 2005); Peter Vergo, *The Music of Painting. Music, Modernism and the Visual Arts from the Romantics to John Cage* (New York: Phaidon, 2010).

⁵ See Ulla-Britta Lagerroth, Hans Lund, Erik Hedling, eds., *Interart Poetics. Essays on the Interrelations of the Arts and Media* (Amsterdam & Atlanta: Rodopi, 1997).

⁶ Michele H. Bogart, *Artists, Advertising, and the Borders of Art* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995).

⁷ See, for instance, the work of Desmond Manderson and Cristina S. Martinez on law and visual culture: Desmond Manderson, ed., *Law and the Visual: Transition, Transformations, and Transmission* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2018); Desmond Manderson, Cristina S. Martinez, "Justice and Art, Face to Face", *Yale Journal of Law & the Humanities*, 20, no. 2 (2016), 241-263; Cristina S. Martinez, "An Emblematic Representation of Law: Hogarth and the Engravers' Act", in *Law and the Visual: Transition, Transformations, and Transmission*, ed. Desmond Manderson (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2018), 75-100.

⁸ Mark Turner, ed., *The Artful Mind: Cognitive Science and the Riddle of Human Creativity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).

⁹ See Jonathan Fineberg, *Modern Art at the Border or Mind and Brain* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2015). For a concise overview on the theoretical application of the neurosciences to visual art, see Mengfei Huang, "The Neuroscience of Art", *Stanford Journal of Neuroscience*, 2 (2009), 24-26.

understand its historical implications, and to pinpoint the features of a contemporary “border aesthetics”¹⁰.

By assessing the limits of a Global Art History¹¹, the discipline (along with the art world) had to put itself in the uncomfortable place of defining and highlighting peripheries, enacting a dialogue with long-established centres of artistic production and theoretical discussion on art. In the past few decades, and particularly from the dawn of the new millennium, the so-called Western World, with its rhizomatic centres well established in territories such as Germany, France, Italy, Great Britain, and the United States of America, has been struggling to find new centres in its old geographical, cultural or historical margins, whether in Latin America, in the Iberian Peninsula, in the Balkans, or in the Middle East, along with the discussion of postcolonialist and postmodernist narratives.¹²

This new focus on territories, previously virtually invisible from the great art historical narratives, has had important consequences in the postmodern re-writing of Art History, not only by broadening its scope and shattering its traditional methodological approaches, as *mirrored*, for instance, in the *New History of Art* of Julian Bell¹³, but also by creating a dignified space for a research niche for local art histories, not far from Ginzburg’s microhistory¹⁴, and mainly in unconformity with the overpowering models of established protagonists - such as Italy for the Renaissance period, France for the Baroque, or the United States for Pop Art, Abstract Expressionism or Conceptual Art, just to name a few immediate correspondences. Nevertheless, its shortcomings are obvious, as defining the periphery implies the acknowledgement of a certain territory’s marginality, in relation to a predeterminate centre that seems

¹⁰ See Anne-Laure Amilhat Szary, “Natures of Borders: From Historical to Prospective Epistemologies”, in *Cartographies of Nature: How Nature Conservation Animates Borders*, ed. Maano Ramutsindela (New Castle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014) 31-53; Johan Schimanski, Stephen F Wolfe, eds., *Border Aesthetics. Concepts and Intersections* (New York & Oxford: Berghahn, 2017), 13.

¹¹ James Elkins, *Is Art History Global?* (New York & London: Routledge, 2007).

¹² The presentation of the journal ARTMargins is perhaps illustrative of this re-centralizing new focus on “art practices and visual culture in the emerging global margins, from North Africa and the Middle East to the Americas, Eastern and Western Europe, Asia and Australasia.”

<https://www.mitpressjournals.org/toc/artm/1/1>

¹³ Julian Bell, *Mirror of the World. A New History of Art* (New York: Thames & Hudson, 2007).

¹⁴ See, for instance, Carlo Ginzburg, “Microhistory: Two or Three Things That I Know about It”, *Critical Inquiry*, 20, no. 1 (1993), 10-35.

historiographically stable and pre-established. Nonetheless, this acknowledgement of a peripheral status is not one-sided, as it may be put at the service of a critique of traditional, western-centric art history¹⁵.

While listing the plethora of authors - whether academics or artists - and works dealing with liminality and the margin would be a rather sterile exercise, it is important to note the contribution of medieval studies to the effective placement of the margin in the centre of art history's concerns. Although "no single discourse of mastery will exhaust our understanding of borders"¹⁶ - or margin, or any other liminal space or status - medieval art has been providing us some of the most important insights regarding the utility of these concepts and, above all, their discussion. With medieval *marginalia* offering prodigal case studies to the wistful eccentricities of the medievalist, the margin has become more than a place of paradox¹⁷. From the pioneer works of Lilian Randall and Lucy Sandler, who recognized and systematized the images painted in the margins of gothic illuminated manuscripts, to Michael Camille's paradigmatic *Image on the Edge*¹⁸, the second half of the 20th century was marked by a growing

¹⁵ The association between African art and a kind of primitivism that first seduced the western art world is still an academic atavism of art historiography. For a thorough discussion on this topic, see Sunanda K. Sanyal, "Transgressing Borders, Shaping an Art History. Rose Kirumira and Makerere's Legacy", *Matatu*, 25, no. 1 (2002), 133-159.

¹⁶ Mireille Rosello, Stephen F. Wolfe, "Introduction", in *Border Aesthetics. Concepts and Intersections*, eds. Johan Schimanski, Stephen F. Wolfe (New York & Oxford: Berghahn, 2017), 1.

¹⁷ From the margins of illuminated manuscripts to the outer borders of medieval buildings, the concept of medieval marginalia has been tacitly expanded, even if without the necessary appraisal of its conceptual validity and practical functionality. Nevertheless, some remarkable works have been approaching liminal imagery in medieval art, such as: Lucy Freeman Sandler, *Illuminators and Patrons in Fourteenth-Century England: The Psalter and Hours of Humphery de Bohun and the Manuscripts of the Bohun Family* (London: The British Library, 2014); Mark Cruse, *Illuminating the Roman d'Alexandre: Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Bodley 264. The Manuscript as Monument* (Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2011); Michael Camille, *The Gargoyles of Notre-Dame: Medievalism and the Monsters of Modernity* (Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, 2009); Laura Kendrick, "Making Sense of Marginalized Images in Manuscripts and Religious Architecture", in *A Companion to Medieval Art*, ed. Conrad Rudolph (Chichester: Blackwell Publishing, 2010), 274-294.

¹⁸ Lilian Randall, "Gothic Marginal Illustrations: Iconography, Style, and Regional Schools in England, North France, and Belgium 1250-1350 A. D." (PhD diss., Radcliffe College, 1955); Lilian Randall, *Images in the Margins of Gothic Manuscripts* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1966); Lucy Sandler, "Formal Principles of

enthusiasm towards the marginal, apparently heterodox, hypothetically transgressive, and rather startling images found in borders, corners, interstices of medieval objects and buildings such as corbels, capitals, gargoyles, choir misericords, and so on. At the same time, oral and popular culture became the centre of the historian, art historian, philosopher and anthropologist's attention, who presented concepts such as the culture of laughter and popular religion¹⁹ - with a link to folklore that was not strange in the context of modern art, since the vanguards themselves were drawn to the transgressive (and marginal) authenticity of folk and primitive art.

This connection became so deep and persistent that soon millennial historiography would borrow a specific word from literature to identify all the images, places, messages and behaviours implied by the margins of medieval art: *marginalia*. A made-up word, *marginalia* made its first documented appearance in 1819, with the publication of excerpts of the notes written in 1804 by Samuel Taylor Coleridge in the margins of the *Works of Thomas Brownes*, destined to be read by Sara Hutchinson²⁰. An inventive invented word, *marginalia* would soon become a literary genre by itself: "readers seem to find that its Latinity confers a degree of seriousness and erudition that "notes", "remarks", "comments", and even "annotations" lack".²¹ One of these readers was Edgar Allan Poe, an audacious marginal writer who loved "an ample margin" where to leave his "purely marginal jottings" for he believed that "In the marginalia, too, we talk only to ourselves; we therefore talk freshly - boldly - originally -

Marginal Illustration in English Psalters of the Thirteenth Century" (MA thesis, Columbia University, 1957); Michael Camille, *Image on the Edge. The Margins of Medieval Art* (London: Reaktion Books, 1992). See also Jeffrey Hamburger, "Image on the Edge: The Margins of Medieval Art: review", *The Art Bulletin*, 75, no. 2 (1993), 319-327; Jean Wirth, "Les marges à drôleries des manuscrits gothiques: problèmes de méthode", in *History and Images: Towards a New Iconology*, eds. Alex Bolvig, Philip Lindley (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), 277-300.

¹⁹ Louis Maeterlinck, *Le genre satirique dans la peinture flamande* (Bruxelles: G. Van Oest, 1907); Louis Maeterlinck, *Le Genre Satirique, Fantastique et Licencieux dans la Sculpture Flamande et Wallone. Les miséricordes de stalles: art et folclore* (Paris: Jean Schemit, 1910); Claude Gaignebet, Dominique Lajoux, *Art Profane et Religion Populaire au Moyen Âge* (Paris: PUF, 1985); Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984).

²⁰ Samuel Taylor Coleridge, "Marginalia I", in *The Collected Works of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. George Whalley, 12 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980), cxv.

²¹ H. J. Jackson, *Marginalia: Readers Writing in Books* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001), 9.

with abandonnement [sic] - without conceit.”²² This very freshness and boldness of the written *marginalia* seems to mirror the vivid qualities of the humorous, provocative, playful, and surprising images that usually border medieval art.

The idea of marginal and mainstream as concurrent territories of artistic practice, particularly in the context of contemporary art, has set its place in the discipline's discourse although, as Donald Kuspit puts it, marginality is just as vanguardist and revitalizing as “the concept of ‘marginal art’ is virtually indefinable”²³. Even though the relationship between art, the margin, and the liminal is not solely defined by the tension between marginal and mainstream, Kuspit's reading on these concepts is still noteworthy: “[it] is a social construction that says more about the mainstream's creative desperation and pursuit of novelty than it does about the sociohistorical - or, for that matter, stylistic - reality of what it labels marginal”²⁴. For it is, indeed, a label as many others, the notion of marginality, along with its corresponding *locus* and the subtlety of the condition of liminality, requires at one time caution and commitment. With fluid connections, centre and margin share a metamorphic nature, particularly contended and debated when the nature of art itself seems to be implicated in the establishment of new (marginal) artistic categories, such as Folk Art, Outsider Art (or Art Brut), or Psychotic Art²⁵.

The margin as a place of exclusion does not cease to be a place of contact and transience. Thus, the condition of marginality implies that of liminality, with limits and thresholds engaged in various forms of interaction between the official and the marginal, the norm and its transgression, erudite culture and folklore, the privileged and the excluded, the normalized and the bizarre, the metropolis and the village, the master and the craftsman and, ultimately, the artist and the observer. In each case, liminality enhances contact as much as ambiguity and

²² Edgar Allan Poe, “Marginalia”, in *The Works of Edgar Allan Poe*, 5 (New York: Armstrong & Son, 1884), 175-350, 178.

²³ Donald Kuspit, “The Appropriation of Marginal Art in the 1980s”, *American Art*, 5, no. 1/2 (1991), 132-141, 132.

²⁴ Kuspit, “The Appropriation of Marginal Art in the 1980s”, 132.

²⁵ David Maclagan, *Outsider Art: From the Margins to the Marketplace* (London: Reaktion Books, 2009).

hybridism, two other categories particularly treasured by contemporary art, art history, and visual studies alike²⁶.

Beyond the strict terminology of liminality, many of the themes now cherished by art history and visual studies are intrinsically liminal in the sense that they evoke ambiguous realities, previously, and sometimes tacitly, marginalized themes and subjects, assumed as secondary or superfluous, that aspire to grasp the transgressive and the paradoxical, the monstrous and the anomalous, the hybrid and the undefined, the minority and its corresponding dynamics of exclusion and inclusion. Reclaimed by postmodernity itself, the grotesque and the ugly, which have lurked in the shadows for many decades, now have a place on stage²⁷. The margins of society, from any historical period, have been closely examined in search of cripples and beggars, criminals and thieves, prostitutes and pimps, witches and heretics²⁸. Cultural and ethnic minorities, along with the phenomena of migration and integration, are also part of the new concerns of art and art history²⁹. And the sexual body and the gender discourse have definitely slipped from the margins to the centre, at the

²⁶ The fluidity of the concept of liminality, as well as its connection with ambiguity, has been firstly developed by Arnold van Gennep and then by Victor Turner in the field of cultural anthropology. For each of the authors, see the reference works: Arnold Van Gennep, *The Rites of Passage* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1960 [1909]); Victor Turner, "Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in Rites of Passage", in *The Forest of Symbols* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1967). See also Bjørn Thomassen, "The Uses and Meanings of Liminality", *International Political Anthropology*, 2, no. 1 (2009), 5-27.

²⁷ Laura Lunger Knoppers, Joan B. Landes, eds., *Monstrous Bodies / Political Monstrosities in Early Modern Europe* (Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press, 2004); Asa Simon Mittman, Peter J. Dendle, eds., *The Ashgate Research Companion to Monsters and the Monstrous* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012); Andrei Pop, Mechtild Widrich, eds., *Ugliness: The Non-Beautiful in Art and Theory* (London & New York: I. B. Tauris, 2014); Frances S. Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

²⁸ Jelle Koopmans, *Le théâtre des exclus au Moyen Age: Hérétiques, sorcières et marginaux* (Paris: Editions Imago, 1997); Sophie Brouquet, *Les marginaux du Moyen Age: ladres, brigands, ribauds, gueux et mendiants au Moyen Age* (Rennes: Ouest-France, 2018).

²⁹ As an example of emancipatory, socially committed research, *The Image of the Black in Western Art* is a series of volumes, prepared since 1960s, and now republished by Harvard University Press, with the recent addition of a volume dedicated to the *Image of the Black in African and Asian Art* (2017). For a comprehensive approach to the contemporary phenomena of migration and alterity, see: Juliet Steyn, Nadja Stamselberg, eds., *Breaching Borders. Art, Migrants and the Metaphor of Waste* (London & New York: I. B. Tauris, 2014).

same time that feminist studies reclaim a place for women in the history of art and culture³⁰.

When applied to visual culture, or when extracted from the realm of images and art, all these themes require a methodological and epistemological apparatus that usually reaches beyond the limits of Art History itself. One of the concepts that more recently has made its entrance in the context of art studies is that of *parergon*, as formulated by Jacques Derrida after its first appearance in Kant's *Critique of Aesthetic Judgement*³¹. Likewise, just like *marginalia*, it is a neologism with a classical accent. However, on the contrary, *parergon* corresponds to a pliable, fluid, and dense concept that applies to all artistic media in any historical period and cultural context. It is, thus, a meeting point to art historians, artists, philosophers, anthropologists, among many other scholars specializing in different periods, allowing them all to grasp liminality, marginality, superfluity and ornament without the insufficiencies of the very idea of margin (and centre). Understood as a hybrid in itself, the notion of *parergon* stands for something (anything) that is added to an artwork, delimiting and enunciating it, diluting it in the transitional space, between the fiction of artistic representation and the corporeal reality of the observer. The *parergon* improves an artwork by ornamenting it and broadens its value and its sense by adding new discursive fragments. *Parergon* is, as follows, the accessory and marginal *extra* without which the work (*ergon*) still exists, but not without suffering an amputation, a loss, an unbalance. This *hors-d'oeuvre*³² has been tacitly assumed by some art historians as a privileged place or condition to artistic creation and inventiveness - a place where *art works*. Besides the frame, which is the ultimate boundary between the pictorial fiction and the observer's reality, there are still other margins where artists have sought to inscribe liminal discourses. Hence the efficiency of the gigantic snail painted by Francesco Cossa at the border of the Dresden *Annunciation*³³ and cleverly spotted - or actually seen - by Daniel Arasse.

³⁰ Some interesting works, with different focuses and approaches to gender in visual culture, are: Jane L. Carroll, Alison G. Stewart, eds., *Saints, Sinners, and Sisters: Gender and Northern Art in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Aldershot & Burlington: Ashgate Publishing, 2003); Katarzyna Kosmala, *Sexing the Border: Gender, Art and New Media in Central and Eastern Europe* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014); Caterina Nirta, *Marginal Bodies, Trans Utopias*, (London & New York: Routledge, 2018).

³¹ Jacques Derrida, *La Vérité en Peinture* (Paris: Flammarion, 1978).

³² Derrida, *La Vérité en Peinture*, 63.

³³ Francesco del Cossa, *Annunciation*, c. 1470-1472, Tempera on panel, Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister, Dresden, Germany.

Indeed, if “Cossa’s stroke of genius was to have pointed to the *limits* of representation by putting his snail at the threshold of this same representation, at its limit”³⁴ is because this same limit is simultaneously an entrance and departing point in and from the visual fiction thus created by the artist. As a fictional device, the marginal snail is a parergonal addition - at the same time superfluous and necessary - and a reminder of the creative power of liminal spaces and eccentric perspectives.

Presentation of the Volume

Despite its epistemological broadness, the current theoretical and methodological centralization of margins has commonly been encapsulated inside the scope of each academic discipline and cultural realm, compromising dialogue, exchange, connection and friction: mandatory conditions to a sound understanding of the most remote and controversial areas of artistic creation, in its multilayered nature.

This much-needed dialogue, along with the urge to grasp the margins from (still) another point of view, is at the heart of the volume *THE CENTRE AS MARGIN. ECCENTRIC PERSPECTIVES ON ART*, a collection of studies which strives to open the debate on margins precisely from the centre. Not the centre as stage for an artificial, uprooted performance of the margin, but as a physical, symbolical, ideological space of its actual infiltration - or even as a potentially marginal space. Since the margin spreads wherever it finds a gap, the challenge is to find it at the centre, through fissures, migrations, appropriations, inversions, dialogues, and usurpations.

In fact, this volume is the result of a just born, long-term project, which first saw the light at the Faculty of Arts and Humanities of the University of Coimbra in May 2017 through the first International Conference *On The Margin*, dedicated to *The Centre as Margin*, where the various contributors of this volume first met. Resulting from recent research developed from the privileged epistemological viewpoint offered by the margin, the volume here presented brings together the contributions of young researchers along with the work of career scholars. Likewise, it does not obey a traditional or a rigid diachronic structure, rather being organized in three major parts that organically articulate the different essays. Within each of these parts in which the book is divided, papers are sometimes organized according to their timeframes, providing the reader with an encompassing (though not encyclopedic) overview of the common

³⁴ Daniel Arasse, *Take a Closer Look*, trans. Alyson Water (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2013), 30.

ground over which the various artistic disciplines build their methodological, theoretical, and thematic centres and margins.

In a framework progressively focused on the tangible, material, and spatial implications of the margin made centre, we will begin by exploring liminal themes, objects and methodological approaches in the art world (Part I). Through a number of case studies (Part II), we will question liminality's discursive, narrative, and semantic potential, between pure visuality and meaning, order and unpredictability; while approaching the centrality of some of its most eccentric, bizarre and monstrous creations, with the human body as a model and vehicle. Still in this part of the volume, we will address the role of textiles as definers of identity, markers of boundaries, inverters of status, simultaneously superfluous and indispensable (as the notion of margin itself). On the last part (Part III) we will finally root the margin at the centre, providing it with a place and a primary sense of space.

The first part of the book, dedicated to the fluid exchanges between the margin and the centre that transforms them both in interchangeable spaces, is composed of essays that deal with marginal subjects from liminal methodological approaches. The first chapter is thus dedicated to a marginal copy of Hieronymus Bosch that intertwines painting and literature to access the ultimate challenge of depicting the invisible. In this essay, Maria José Goulão explores the means and the implications of envisioning and depicting the matter of dreams, the *topos* of the vision and the idea of the afterworld, while expanding the framework of History of Art itself. From the different versions of the *Visions of the Knight Tondal*, to the "visual palimpsest" crystallized in an anonymous painting made after Bosch's nightmarish sceneries and kept in a Portuguese collection, Goulão moves from the heart of art historiography to the very limits of its territory with History, Theology, Visual Anthropology, and Literature, in order to finally retrieve a "geography of the hereafter".

From Bosch, the early modern painter that never left medieval imagery, bringing its margins to the very heart of his paintings, we cross the borders of Art and History, to enter the realms of Musicology and Philosophy, through an approach to Robert Schumann's *Davidsbündlertänze op. 6* from a Deleuzian perspective. By applying the rhizomatic concept of image of thought to the margins of Schumann's work, Ana Isabel Nistal Freijo explores the multiple (and decentralized) territories of creation and identity, through the multiple pseudonyms, the recurrent quotations and the poetic hybridity between music and literature. The *decentering* thus proposed by Nistal Freijo defines the margin as an indispensable place

and medium of expansion, multiplication and self-definition of Schumann's op. 6.

Moving further to the margins of modernism, Jessica Schouela approaches a central work of an artist whose role in the definition of modern concepts of art, architecture and design is (still) usually kept at the margins of Le Corbusier's eloquent protagonism. Through Amédée Ozenfant's *Foundations of Modern Art*, Schouela explores the definition of a modern identity through the ever-marginalizing mechanisms of alterity, choice and exclusion. Defining what is (or should be) modern through the example of what is not, becomes thus an evident process of creative self-construction that not only deals with art and art theory, but also with anthropology and ethnography, in a deeply sociological dialogue between civilization and primitiveness, present and past, elegance and excess, white and black. Nevertheless, this dialogue, whether mute or conflictive, is not always univocal, and Schouela's essay works precisely in its liminal lines of rhetorical power.

In another dialogue, this time between the contemporary photography of Joel-Peter Witkin and the 19th century work of Félix Nadar, Carla Alexandra Gonçalves questions the transgressive limits of the representation, (re)construction and ontology of the body through the image itself. Moving between the realms of art and science, artwork and document, Gonçalves presents the body simultaneously as a subject and an object of artistic creation, locating its operative existence *in-between*. Between the ultimate intimacy that the individual body requires and the utmost exposure inflicted upon the public body (whether a medical body or an art-object body), lies the dynamic tension that connects the centre and the margin.

Following this path of cross-disciplinary dialectics and liminal methodological approaches, the first part of this volume closes with an essay that calls upon the contributions of Philosophy, Sociology, Anthropology and Ethnography along with Theatre and Performance, to consider creative marginality as a form of counter-discourse between central and established forms of power. "From Nonsense to Avant-Garde", Ricardo Seïça Salgado invites us to give a closer look to the marginally resistant history of a Portuguese 62-year-old theatre group : Coimbra's Academy Theatrical Initiation Circle. Through art and politics, Salgado delves into both the conceptual and operative potential of marginality to dramaturgy and social life alike.

The second part of this volume offers a comprehensive approach to the many possibilities of the liminal discourse in Art through specific case studies that are nonetheless thematically organized in three main areas.

The first one is dedicated to the role of order and continuity – and its interruptions and tensions – in the very borders, extremes and margins of artworks. Framed by a broad medieval chronology that goes from the Celtic and Insular Early Middle Ages to the 15th century, it is crossed by a general focus on the problems and limits of interpretation and meaning, calling upon aspects such as narrativity and visuality, programming and randomness, closeness and distance, intimacy and public display.

In the first essay, Beatriz Loureiro presents center and margin as both spaces and concepts, mostly understood as “enhancers of meaning” operative in Celtic literature and art. From the non-linear narratives of the Otherworld, occasionally visited by exceptional mortals, to the non-figurative ornament of personal objects, Loureiro draws a path where ambiguity, metamorphosis, and juxtaposition work as perceptive anchors that give sense to both centre and margins. Especially concerned with the theoretical frame(s) and conceptual apparatus that may enlighten and further intertwine these marginal expressions of literature and material culture (both visual and artistic in their own right), this incursion through symmetry, sinuosity and circularity moves far beyond the Irish Celtic territories from which it departs.

This eccentric way of establishing order and mnemonic coherence beyond linearity or figuration is once again tested in Lúcia Rosas’ essay on the programming, order and meaning of Romanesque capital sculpture. Usually considered highly symbolic and cryptic, Romanesque sculpture is frequently placed in one of two extremes: the mere ornamental function or the illustration of highly complex theological figures and narratives. By beginning to question the role phytomorphic motifs – perhaps, the most marginal(ized) of all categories of visual display – Rosas approaches one of the most complex realities of Romanesque art: the relation between architectural space and its sculptural decoration. Using a case study particularly dear (but nonetheless obscure) to Portuguese art historiography, the church of St. Christopher of Rio Mau, Rosas will test the apparent randomness of these motifs’ placement, while simultaneously approaching figurative and historiated capitals to further explore organizational schemes, narrative links and liminal dynamics.

Through this same realm of marginal, little explored study objects and subjects, Ana Cristina Sousa’s essay gives further development to the inquiry into the meaning of medieval liminal iconography. Dedicated to an exceptional 15th century Flemish tomb and effigy made of copper, silver and gold panels, Sousa’s study sheds light over an artwork that has been neglected by historiography. Kept mute, and almost invisible, the tomb of the young son of the king João I, commissioned by Isabella of

Portugal, Duchess of Burgundy, is bordered by profusely carved panels with a display of ordered chaos and fantasy not very distant from those of medieval *marginalia*. To look and to (finally) question these images, allowing them to *speak*, is thus one of the major contributions of this essay that centralizes the margin to affirm its sense and purpose.

Beyond the limits of the human, the next set of case studies is dedicated to the visual and rhetorical power that resonates from the display of the bizarre, the extraordinary, the diabolical, or simply *the other*. The illustrative qualities of the monster, a composite, undefined and uncategorized, eccentric and marginal being, have turned it into a major concern of art history, literature, as well as many other disciplines of the Humanities. In this case, the aim is not to grasp the monstrous expression as a synthesis of the anthropological relation between centre and margin, but rather to use the monster as a tool to enlighten the mysteries of creation and the very human nature.

Along these lines, the fourth essay focuses on the monstrous creative *persona* of the eccentric 17th century Mexican nun Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz, approached through three poetic portraits that clearly illustrate the composite, disjunctive, highly idealized and frequently interventive role of the monster. In this essay, necessarily anchored by the literary formulas that give body to Sor Juana's works, Octavio Páez Granados clearly stresses the visual efficacy of the poetic portrait, while simultaneously addressing fundamental topics such as Sor Juana's disruptive approach to the standards of beauty of her time, the role of women in the artistic and intellectual milieu, the tensions of the relationship between the centre and the margins of her own society, and the sibylline, hybrid and monstrous nature of baroque aesthetics itself.

Without leaving the Baroque period, Mariano Casas Hernández leads us through a much-needed study of 18th century misericord iconography. Focusing on the choir stalls of the Cathedral of Salamanca, this essay deals with one of the most marginalized expressions of a very popular and actually over-centralized marginal theme: choir misericords. Usually approached in their medieval and early modern expressions, misericords kept on being a favourite place and popular space for the display of profane, fantastical, and composite motifs during the modern period. Whether playing with the plastic ductility of wood and displaying the artist's free imagination or drawing on established models common to other artistic media, and whether simply ludic and ornamental, functionally apotropaic or deeply meaningful in the context of theological thought, these sculptures are part of a vast marginal universe that lies at the very heart of liturgical space. Casas Hernández essay sheds light on the

eloquence and meaning of these images, centralizing them to better connect their expressions to 17th and 18th century readings on demonic forces, well rooted in theories of “nature as a vehicle of corruption”.

Returning to the human behind the monster, or the monster as a staged condition of the strangeness of alterity, Paola Pacifici explores the iconography of the double. Located between nature and culture – at the fruitful intersection of both, more than at a no-man’s land – the display of human oddities and marvels brings the wondrous monster of classical literature and science to the verge of the 20th century culture. Anchored in the interdependence between the textual description and the visual illustration of the monster, Pacifici underlines the broad temporality of the image, usually crystallized in models that serve many different textual sources, whether literary or scientific. Bringing the monster to the present time, Pacifici presents it as a liminal, and frequently marginalized projection of otherness that requires an audience to exist, since “there is no *private* monster”.

Without ever leaving the human and bodily dimension of the artistic experience of the margin, the following studies are exclusively dedicated to its textile outer projection. As a border between the intimacy of the body and the world in which one interacts with the other or as a physical delimitation between spaces - the textile is a fluid, ductile, and volatile expression of the many modalities of interaction between centre and margin. The last three essays of Case Studies on Liminality cross a huge temporal span to lead us through some of these modalities.

Barbara Margarethe Eggert leads us through the marginalization of women in 13th century convents, and the potentially transgressive role of the liturgical vestments and precious textiles produced by them and worn by their highest rank representatives. Focusing on a preserved set known as the Göss Vestments, Eggert questions the many roles of textiles as boundaries between spaces of privilege and exclusion, to propose the protagonism of the Göss Vestments in the “demarginalization strategy” enacted by the abbess Kunegunde II. Dealing with relational binomials such as opacity and transparency, visibility and invisibility, optic and haptic, Eggert’s essay also draws our attention to the performative and ritual role of these textiles, along with their ostensibly expositive potential, which allowed their commissioners and wearers to weave and embroider on them their own personal convictions and expectations, sometimes re-writing history and re-inventing hierarchies.

Separated by almost seven centuries, Kunegunde II and Lygia Pape were both women that used the powerful liminality of textiles to express their own ideas of order and identity, and to renegotiate the relationship

between centre and periphery. In the next essay, Jacqueline Witkowski approaches Lygia Pape's textile experiments as a form of communicating and materializing her dissent towards the artistic, cultural and socio-political background of the 50s, 60s and 70s in Brazil. Between the crystallized mental structures of colonialism and the oppression of a dictatorial regime, the weaving experiences of Pape, with their performative and bodily nature become, as argued by Witkowski, a reminder of the indigenous roots and marginalized communities of a country that only recently rescued her memory and work from the margins of art historiography interests.

The last essay of this second part, presented by Nuno Nogueira and Inês Simões, sums up this communicative power of textiles as liminal coverings (or dividers) of the body by focusing on garments, their planning and structure and, mostly, their interaction with the body. Establishing a theoretical framework that goes from Derrida's reading of the Kantian *parergon* to Csordas' *cultural embodiment*, Nogueira and Simões further explore the historicity of the relation between body and clothing - and the margins of both -, stressing its role in the definition of posture, behaviour and, ultimately, identity. Neither intrinsically part of the body nor detached from it, neither really bi-dimensional nor three-dimensional, tangible but fluid, necessary but superfluous, garments "contextualize the body" and are hence a paragon of the central qualities of the margin.

With three essays that chronologically bridge the late medieval and the modern period, the final section of this volume summons the limits and challenges of spatial categories: from the domestic setting to the religious space and the urban planning. In the first essay, Marta Simões establishes a conceptual framework for the study of the domestic space that draws on the *warburgian* notion of atlas to map the objects, behaviours and patterns recurrently observed in painted depictions of domestic interiors between the 15th and 16th centuries. Searching the margin at the very core of the centre of each miniature, engraving or panel painting, Simões focuses on two unexpected study cases: a blue-squared pillow (a usually invisible object at the background of the painting), and a devotional image of the Virgin and the Child (a painting within the painting). By focusing on the details that enliven the overall setting of domestic pictorial spaces, Simões simultaneously inverts the usual analytical approach that tends to opacify the role of objects in a composition (unless their symbolical meaning is too obvious to be forgotten), and creates a net of linked margins that give sense to the domestic scenery, expanding its interpretative potential.

This search for a place for the margin within the visual fiction of a graphic space continues in the essay of Berrin Terim, who proposes to *read Filarete from the margin*. Dealing with various layers of marginality and marginalization, Terim approaches the controversial figure of Antonio di Pietro Averlino, disregarded by centuries of art historiography, to enquire into the margins of his Treatise on Architecture, for a long time considered a poetical or metaphorical *oeuvre* rather than a proper theoretical approach to architecture and urbanism. Handling both text and images as complementary parts of the same creative process, Terim delves into the centre and the margins of the *Codex Magliabechianus*, preserved at the Central National Library of Florence, to capture the graphic forms of the *idea* that presides over the enticing project of Sforzinda. Assuming it as a hybrid work, Terim proposed Filarete's Treatise as a narrative of architecture – not a representation of something yet to be, but “as an end in and of itself.”

Still in the realm of architectural space, Maria de Lurdes Craveiro's essay focuses on the multiple roles of the narthex in the period of the Portuguese Catholic Reformation. Dealing with a geographical reality that is still little known beyond its own historiographical boundaries, this essay sheds light over the functional and symbolic nature of an eminently liminal architectural element. Neither completely closed nor open, not yet the space of the church but also not the profane space around it, the narthex was, since the Paleochristian period to the 17th century (and beyond), a place of initiation and exclusion, of preparation and penitence, of anticipation and participation, of mourning and memory, of presence and circulation. Drawing on the long tradition that equates the narthex with the Christian building, and thus stressing its role as an identity mark, Craveiro further clarifies its role in the Humanist culture of 15th and 16th century Portugal. By testifying the persistence of this element during the 17th century, whether in great architectural enterprises or in little chapels and hermitages, Craveiro not only presents the narthex as a fundamental device of the “theatricality of religious sociability”, central to the devotional strategies of a reforming church, as she also affirms the dilution of the frontiers historiographically established between Humanism and Counter Reformation.

With the artistic phenomenon, and its multiple demeanours and behaviours, resonances and dilutions, as a common ground, the Centre as Margin will hopefully be a comprehensive and multidisciplinary discussion platform, encouraging the dialogue between different disciplines, on all timeframes, supported by the interest to deal with the complex nature of the (inter)relationship between centre and margin. One of the main (and

PAGES MISSING
FROM THIS FREE SAMPLE

Contributors

Maria José Goulão holds a PhD in Art History (Univ. of Coimbra, 2005), and is a full-time professor of Art History at the Faculty of Fine Arts of the University of Porto. She lectured and held full courses at the Faculty of Arts of the University of Coimbra, at the Faculty of Sciences of the University of Porto, and at Doctorate Programs from the Universidad Pablo de Olavide (Seville, Spain) on South American Colonial Art, and “Cultural Heritages of Portuguese Influence” (III-UC, University of Coimbra). She also lectured at the Fine Arts Academy of Karlsruhe, at the École Supérieure d’Art d’Aix-en-Provence (ESAAix), and at the Accademia di Belle Arti di Verona. She is a researcher at GEMA (Group of Multidisciplinary Studies in Art, CEAACP), and a member of the Portuguese Association of Art Historians, of ICOMOS, and of ICOM. She is the author of many published articles, diverse chapters and one book, on subjects from Medieval, Renaissance and South American Art. She has carried out extensive research on the circulation of artistic forms in the South Atlantic region during the colonial period (her PhD dissertation is entitled: *“La puerta falsa de América”: Portuguese artistic influence in the Rio de la Plata region during the colonial period*).

Ana Isabel Nistal Freijo is a PhD student in Arts | Music Studies at Faculty of Arts and Humanities, University of Coimbra (under the supervision of Professor Diogo Ferrer and Professor Miguel Ribeiro-Pereira). She holds an MA from the Nova School of Social and Humanities (Nova University of Lisbon) in Philosophy | Aesthetics and a BM from Porto’s Superior School of Music and Performing Arts (ESMAE) in Piano.

Ana Freijo is a Research Fellow (Associate Member) at Centre for Classic and Human Studies (CECH), University of Coimbra, and she is also teaching at ESMAE.

The research presented in this volume was developed under the project UID/ELT/00196/2013, funded by the Portuguese FCT – Foundation for Science and Technology.

Jessica Schouela is originally from Montreal, Canada. She completed her BA in Art History and World Cinemas at McGill University in Montreal. She holds an MA from University College London in History of Art, where she

wrote her dissertation on *The Challenge for Change* documentary films made on Fogo Island in 1967. She is currently pursuing her PhD in History of Art at the University of York (under the supervision of Professor Michael White), which looks at the documentation of modernist form, architecture and environment in Europe and America between 1910- 1940. She has presented at conferences in England and the United States. Other interests include: photography, documentary, artistic practices in remote areas, abstraction, feminism and film.

Carla Alexandra Gonçalves is a full-time professor in the Department of Social Sciences and Management of the Universidade Aberta since 1999. She concluded her PhD at the University of Coimbra in February 2006 with the thesis "Sculptors and sculpture in Coimbra, a journey beyond the Renaissance". Between 1999 and 2006 she was part of the Center for Interdisciplinary Historical Studies of the Universidade Aberta. She is a researcher at the Center for Studies in Archeology, Arts and Heritage Sciences of the University of Coimbra, I&D unit n.º. 281, in the Group of Multidisciplinary Studies in Art, since 2007, and a member of the Portuguese Association of Art Historians. She is the author of several books, articles and other papers within her areas of interest: sculpture from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries; Studies on the Body; Visual Anthropology; Psychology of Art; Phenomenology of Perception; Sociology of Art.

Ricardo Seça Salgado is an anthropologist and a performer. His main research interest lies in the relation between anthropology, theatre, education and politics. Right now, as an integrated researcher of CRIA-UMinho (Centre for Research in Anthropology, University of Minho) he develops experimental research methodologies, mixing participant-observation with theatre methods in a prison context. Seça Salgado holds a PhD in Anthropology, performance studies and education studies approach. Visiting scholar at Tisch School of the Arts, NYU. He published several articles in peer-review journals, also covering performance art events for some magazines. He made a documentary about a university theatre group called CITAC. Invited professor at ESTAL (Lisbon) for 3 years. Recently he's a founding member of baldio | performance studies, a place to rehearse an interdisciplinary, politically committed approach merging theory and practice. As a performer, he made workshops in several techniques: Suzuki Method and Viewpoints Training, Clown Technique, Persona: Performing Yourself, Actor's Studio Method, Commedia dell' Art, Theatre of the Oppressed, recently working with SITI Company, Akademia Ruchu, Nao Bustamante, Clarina Maclow. Artistic director of projecto BUH!, where he develops independent productions as director and performer.

Beatriz Loureiro Beatriz César Loureiro holds a BA in Art History from the Faculty of Arts of the University of Coimbra and is currently a student of the Master's programme in Art and Heritage of the same institution. In 2016/2017 she was part of the European Liberal Arts Network (ELAN) exchange programme at Uppsala University where she studied Celtic History, Literature and Culture, thus laying the groundwork that would serve as basis for the following paper.

Lúcia Rosas Lúcia Rosas is a Cathediatric Professor (Department of Heritage Studies, Faculty of Arts, Oporto University), member of CITCEM (Transdisciplinary Culture, Space and Memory Research Centre – FCT I&D unit 4059). Is responsible for several courses in Medieval Art History and Heritage. The research is aiming at two lines of work: Medieval Art and Architecture – space, iconography and liturgy; studies of Heritage. Lúcia Rosas is a researcher in European projects such as: A NEW STANDARD FOR REGIONAL HISTORICAL RESEARCH. Eurocore *Cuius Regio. An analysis of the cohesive and disruptive forces destining the attachment of groups of persons to and the cohesion within regions as a historical phenomenon* (CURE), European Science Foundation; COST (European Cooperation in Science and Technology): *Medieval Europe – Medieval Cultures and Technological Resources*.

Ana Cristina Sousa is Assistant Professor in the Department of Heritage Studies, Faculty of Arts of the University of Porto and researcher at CITCEM (Transdisciplinary Culture, Space and Memory Research Centre), in the same faculty. She holds a PhD in Portuguese Art History, Master in Art History and BA in Art History from Faculty of Arts, University of Porto. Her research interests are Iconography, Late Medieval and Early Modern Period Jewellery and Applied Arts.

Octavio Páez Granados holds a master's degree in Spanish Language, Literature and Culture, with a specialty in research and literary criticism, from the University of Geneva. He also holds a Master's degree in Art Studies - Music Studies, from the University of Coimbra and a degree in Early Music – Harpsichord, by the School of Music and Arts the Performing Arts (ESMAE) of the Polytechnic Institute of Oporto. Due to this double formation, his main fields of interest and research focus on the music-literature relationship during the Spanish-Lusitanian imperial era of the 16th and 17th centuries; as well as in the different types of masculinities and "dissident sexualities" in the Ibero-American literature of the mentioned centuries and in the Latin American literature of the neo-baroque type.

The research presented in this volume was developed under the project UID/ELT/00196/2013, funded by the Portuguese FCT – Foundation for Science and Technology.

Mariano Casas Hernández holds a PhD in Art History and degrees in Art History, Ecclesiastical Studies and Biblical Theology. He works as a professor at the Department of Art History / Fine Arts of the University of Salamanca, and is author of several books and articles about Sacred Art Image, one of his main lines of research. He is a member of the GIR "Cultural History and Universities Alfonso IX" (CUNALIX) of the University of Salamanca (USAL), full member of the Institute of Medieval and Renaissance Studies (IEMYR) of the University of Salamanca (USAL) and founding member of the Vivanco Studies Center (CEV).

Paola Pacifici is a researcher and a curator, currently working as scientific coordinator at the Hermann Geiger Cultural Foundation, Italy. Awarded with a PhD in Aesthetics at the University of Sorbonne Nouvelle, Paris, with a thesis on Anatomy in the Renaissance, she has worked in several international institutions, including University of Calgary, CA, National Institute for Renaissance Studies in Florence, IT, Leeds Museums and Galleries, UK. She published extensively on modern and contemporary art, with a focus on the iconography of the human body and the relationship between art and science. Her monograph *San Sebastiano. Sangue, nudità e peste nella pittura devozionale Toscana 1350-1500* is currently being printed.

Barbara Margarethe Eggert is a research associate with the Department of Arts and Cultural Science at the Danube University, Krems. Since 1996, one of Barbara M. Eggert's research foci lies on media that combine text and images. She wrote her MA thesis (2000) on illuminated fable manuscripts and early prints whereas for her MA thesis in Adult Education/Museum Studies (2010) she analysed audio scripts for audio guides in museums. In her PhD thesis (2009), she investigated functions of the imagery on medieval vestments (13th to 15th century) with respect to the liturgy of the Holy Mass. The title of Eggert's habilitation project is "Victory for the Comic Muse. The Past, Present and Future of Comics in Museums and Exhibitions". She also works as a freelance curator for Gallery Daliko, Krems and writes scenarios for web comics/graphic novels.

Jacqueline Witkowski is a PhD candidate and a four-year fellow in the University of British Columbia's Department of Art History, Visual Art & Theory. She specializes in the intersections between aesthetics and politics as conveyed through the modern and contemporary practices of

textile and fibre artwork, and her wider interests include feminist and queer theory, modes of collaboration, and art as activism. Her dissertation, “Disappearing Threads: Textile Practices in Argentina, Brazil, and Chile, 1964-1990,” investigates how artists countered hegemonic governments by reconsidering the role of indigenous populations and histories within their respective countries through the material means and metaphorical capability of textiles. Witkowski has presented her work at institutions throughout the U.S. and Canada, including the Universities Art Association of Canada and the Midwest Art History Society. In 2015, she published on the history of craft in relation to digital and tactile warfare in the University of Rochester’s journal, *InVisible*, and in the Morris and Helen Belkin Art Gallery’s 2014 MFA exhibition on the history between labour and craft. Her research was generously funded by the Mitacs Globalink Scholarship in 2016, in which she conducted research at the Museu Arte Moderna do Rio de Janeiro, Museu de Arte de São Paulo, Museo de la Solidaridad Salvador Allende, and Fundación Espigas.

Nuno Nogueira is currently a PhD student in Design at Faculdade de Arquitectura de Lisboa, holding a research scholarship of Centro de Investigação em Arquitectura, Urbanismo e Design (CIAUD) since 2016. He holds a BA in Fashion Design (Faculdade de Arquitectura de Lisboa, 2008) and an MSc (Faculdade de Arquitectura de Lisboa, 2015). He was given a Merit Award for the higher classification given to a Masters dissertation in 2014/2015. His research interests focus on Pattern Design, more specifically in the interactions between the body and garment. In 2016, together with Dr Inês Simões, he presented the paper “The influence of seams on body posture” at The Second International Conference for Creative Pattern Cutting, at University of Huddersfield, UK. He is a research member of the Research Group *Pattern-ology* (CIAUD) since 2017.

Inês Simões (b. 1961) holds a BA in Painting (Escola Superior de Belas Artes, Universidade de Lisboa, 1985), an AAS Degree in Patternmaking (Fashion Institute of Technology, State University of New York, 1990), an MSc in Design (Faculdade de Arquitectura da Universidade Técnica de Lisboa, 2005) and a PhD in Design (Faculdade de Arquitectura da Universidade Técnica de Lisboa, 2012). Her professional activity comprises the fields of fine arts, fashion design, costume design and pattern design. She is an Assistant Professor at Faculdade de Arquitectura da Universidade de Lisboa since 1992. Main subjects: 2D and 3D Pattern Design (first cycle of study in Fashion Design), Draping (second cycle of study in Fashion Design) and Project (third cycle of study in Design). She is a research member of the Centro de Investigação em Arquitectura,

Urbanismo e Design (CIAUD) since 2007 and of the Centro de Investigação em Território, Arquitectura e Design (CITAD) since 2013; she is the coordinator of the Research Group *Pattern-ology* (CIAUD) since 2017. While her research and writing is focused on the paradigms in the representation of the body in pattern design as well as the influence of seams on body/dress balance; other research interests include alternative pedagogical approaches to teaching/learning fashion design.

Marta Simões is a graduated in Art History and Law from Coimbra University. She is currently an Art History PhD candidate at the same university with a thesis entitled “A Construção do Cenário Doméstico em Portugal: Arte e Cultura Material nos séculos XV e XVI” (*Building the domestic scenery in Portugal: Art and Material Culture in the 15th and 16th centuries*). She is also a researcher at the Group for Multidisciplinary Studies in Art (GEMA) at the (Center for Studies in Archeology, Arts and Heritage Sciences of Coimbra University (CEAACP). Her main research interests have been in the areas of Medieval and Early Modern Art, Visual Studies, Anthropology of Image, Material Culture, Iconology and Iconography of Space, all interconnected by the domestic element.

Berrin Terim is a full-time lecturer at Clemson faculty since Spring 2016 where she teaches history, theory and design. She is currently enrolled in the PhD program at VirginiaTech Washington Alexandria Architecture Center, where she has taught graduate level design studio and Topics in Design Methods course. During her masters, she has assisted in teaching design courses and visual communication classes. In 2010, she received College Creative Achievement Award from Penn State University. After completion of her bachelors, she practiced as an architect in Izmir, Turkey. Berrin's research in architecture focuses on representation. Her early studies centered on cosmological perspectives, particularly exploring the dichotomy between perception and de-centralized point of view constructed by the intellect. Her dissertation work is focusing on anthropomorphism in architectural design, through the role of metonymy. Her research is exploring this framework through the narrative of the fifteenth century Florentine architect Il Filarete's treatise on architecture. Berrin has presented her work in international conferences.

Maria de Lurdes Craveiro is a Professor at the Art History Institute of the Faculty of Arts and Humanities of the University of Coimbra (FLUC), Portugal. She is also the principal researcher of the “Group in Multidisciplinary Studies in Art” (GEMA), at the Center for Archeology, Arts and Heritage Sciences, Unit I&D-281, of the Foundation of Science and Technology. In collaboration with multiple organizations, she has had

a prominent action in the defense, conservation and dissemination of architectural heritage. In this context, and within the scope of Art History, she was part of diverse safeguarding projects and campaigns of several patrimonial structures. With more than fifty scientific papers published in Portugal, Spain, Belgium and Brazil, her work covers the exercise of conceptual revision in Art History, the heritage sciences, as well as the fields of painting, sculpture and architecture from the late Middle Ages to the neoclassical period.

Joana Antunes is an assistant professor at the Faculty of Arts and Humanities of the University of Coimbra, and an integrated researcher of the Multidisciplinary Art Studies Group (GEMA) at the Research Centre in Archeology, Arts and Heritage Sciences of the University of Coimbra (CEAACP). Specialized in Art History, with a particular focus on late medieval and early modern iconology, liminality and *marginalia*, her PhD thesis was dedicated to “The Limit of the Margin in Portuguese Art (14th to 16th centuries)”. With several papers presented and published in Portuguese and English, her interests meet the multi-epochal, interartistic dialogue within the broad framework of Art History and Visual Studies.

Index

A

abstraction, 103
Aby Warburg, 265
accidental beauty, 172
Adolf Loos, 39
Adriaen Isenbrant, 274
Albrecht Dürer, 203
Ali Agamet, 205
altar, 215
ambiguity, 101
Ambroise Paré, 207
Amédée Ozenfant, 37
antependium, 222
Antonio Averlino, 281
antropofagia, 232
apotropaic, 116, 154
apparatus, 79
architecture, 301
Art History, xiii
Asturias, 304
Atlas, 265
atrium, 302
Austria, 214
avant-garde, 69

B

Baroque, 165
basilicas, 303
bear-man, 148
Bertolt Brecht, 213
black, 46
blue checked pillow, 269
boar, 150
body, 5, 51, 167, 205, 237, 245
border aesthetics, xv
borders, xiii

boundaries, xiii
Braga, 133
Brazil, 232
bridge, 16
Burgundy, 143

C

canopy, 140
capitals, 115
catechumens, 302
Catholic Reformation, 301
Celtic Art, 94
Celts, 93
centaurs, 153
chaos, 186
chapels, 307
chasuble, 222
choir, 178, 216
choirstalls, 177
Christus Salvator, 225
CITAC, 74
Clara Wieck, 27
clefs, 168
Clio, 213
clothes, 246
Codex Magliabechianus, 282
Coimbra, 115
Colloredo brothers, 208
colonnade, 302
cosmogony, 289
Council of Trent, 312
counter-hegemonic, 70
counterpoint, 170

D

D. Afonso, 133
D. Isabel of Portugal, 135

daguerreotype, 55
 dance, 31
 Daniel Arasse, xx
 Davidsbündlertänze op 6, 21
 death, 65
 deer, 149
 Deleuzian, 22
 democracy, 75
 Demons, 182
 Derick Baegert, 276
Des monstres et des prodiges, 207
deschi da parto, 274
 Devil, 182
Devotio Moderna, 271, 306
 diabolical, 181
dicephali, 207
 dictatorship, 75
 Didier Anzieu, 249
 Diebold Schiling, 266
 discontinuity, 116
disegno, 284
 dissemination, 116
 domestic, 265
 door, 304
 double-head, 204
 Dreams, 5

E

eagle, 150
 Early Irish, 93
 Edgar Allan Poe, xvii
 emancipation, 69
 embodiment, 252
 Ernst Martin, 208

F

fabric, 231
 favela, 231
 Félix Guattari, 23
 Félix Nadar, 56
 female convents, 217
 female self-demarginalization,
 214
 Filarete, 281
 Flanders, 135
 Fluxus, 73
 Folk Art, xviii
 Fortunio Liceti, 208
Foundations of Modern Art, 39

frames, 97, 221, 272
 Francesco Sforza, 282
 freaks, 210

G

Galeazzo Maria Sforza, 284
 galilee, 302
 garments, 245
 George Kubler, 311
 Georges Didi-Huberman, 266
 Gilles Deleuze, 21, 79
 Giorgio Agamben, 70
 Giorgio Vasari, 281
 Goess, 214
 Green Man, 191
 griffin, 154
 grotesque, xix, 64, 188, 210, 251

H

habitus, 253
 hall-church, 311
 Hans-Georg Gadamer, 81
harmony, 171
 Helio Oiticica, 231
 hell, 10
Hermaphrodite, 56
 hermitages, 307
 hero, 97
 Hesiod, 202
 heterotopia, 72
 Hieronymus Bosch, 4
 high-choir, 313
 household, 267
 Huizinga, 8
 human marvel, 202
 Hunterston brooch, 101
 hybrids, 58, 153

I

iconomania, 56
 ideal city, 309
 identity, 57, 232, 245
Illustrious Generation, 142
 image of thought, 21
intermezzi, 24
 intersexuality, 58
 intervention music, 76

J

Jacques Derrida, xx
 Jan van Eyck, 141, 143
 Jesuits, 311
 Joel-Peter Witkin, 63

K

Kunegunde II, 214

L

Late Antiquity, 304
 Le Corbusier, 39
 Le Goff, 8
 lectern, 169
Legenda Aurea, 118
Libro Architetonico, 291
limen, 7
 liminal, xiii, 5, 93, 177, 301
 liminality, xix, 80
 lion, 149
 liturgical vestments, 214
 Lygia Pape, 231

M

Mabinogion, 95
 Macrobius, 7
Madonnas, 276
 mainstream, xviii
 Marc Allégret, 39
 marginal art, xviii
 marginalia, xvi
 margins, xiii
 margins of the body, 246
 Mark Twain, 209
 Maurice Merleau-Ponty, 252
meaning, 129
 medical marvels, 210
memento mori, 60
 memory, 108
 metaphor, 108, 153, 167, 242,
 249, 283
 Mexican, 164
 Michael Baxandall, 178
 Michel Foucault, 70
 Michel Serres, 259
miracula, 270

misericords, 177
 modernism, 233
 modernity, 38
 monster, 166, 201
Monstrorum Historia, 207
 Mother, 166
motto, 32
mudéjar, 307
 multilinear system, 34
 music sign, 169
 musical cipher, 29
 Myth, 107

N

narthex, 301
Natural History, 204
 Neapolitan relation, 31
 Negro art, 42
 Negrophilia, 48
 Neo-Concrete manifesto, 234
 New Spain, 161
 Nietzsche, 22
 non-figurative arts, 98
 Nonsense, 70
 nude, 57
 nun, 166

O

Order of Carmel, 314
 Order of Cluny, 305
 Order of St. Jerome, 306
 ornament, 44
 Oswald de Andrade, 235
 Otherworld, 3, 93
 Outsider Art, xviii

P

paleochristian church, 303
 palmistry, 62
 parangoles, 231
parergon, xx, 245
pasticheurs, 10
 pattern, 250
 Pattern Design, 246
 pelican, 150
 penitents, 302
 performing arts, 69
 period eye, 178

peripheral, 283
 phoenix, 150
 photography, 51, 54
 Pierre Bourdieu, 252
 pilgrimages, 308
 pillows, 268
 plain architecture, 311
plainchant, 170
 play, 82
 popular devotion, 307
 Portugal, 304
 Prince D. Afonso, 141
 profane, 86, 115, 177, 276, 306
 pronaos, 303
proportion, 171
 pseudonym, 25
 Psychotic Art, xviii
 puzzle images, 100

R

Renaissance, 309
 revolution, 75
 rhizome, 23
 Rhythm, 31
 Robert Schumann, 21
 Rogier van der Weyden, 276
 Romanesque, 115

S

Salamanca, 179
 Samuel Taylor Coleridge, xvii
 scheme, 116
 sculpture, 115
 seams, 257
 Sforzinda, 282
 shape-shifting, 110
 Siamese twins, 209
 sign, 105
 sirens, 153
 skin, 245
skin-ego, 249
 solmisation, 170
 Sor Juana Ines de la Cruz, 161
 spiral designs, 97
 St. Christopher, 117
 storytelling, 101
 styles, 301

Subalternity, 69
synesthetic, 167

T

Tailors, 247
 taunt, 190
 textiles, 214, 220
*The Tragedy of Pudd'nhead
 Wilson*, 209
 theatre, 74
 Thomas Csordas, 252
 Thomas Oliver, 250
 tomb, 135
Tondal, 3
tondo, 274
 Touch, 255
Travels in the Congo, 39
 Tropicalia movement, 232
 Tupi-Guarani, 235

U

Ulisse Aldrovandi, 207
 Umberto Eco, 256
 unorthodox, 282
 utopia, 293

V

Victor Hugo, 60
 Victor Turner, 72
 Virgin and Child, 272
Visio, 5
 Vitruvius, 285

W

W. H. Hulme, 251
 Western culture, 43
 white, 45
 wild man, 146
 woodcut, 205

Z

zoomorphic, 101