Embodied Testimonies, Gendered Memories, and the Poetics of Trauma

Exploring the Intersection of Deconstructionist and Postcolonial Trauma Theory

Edited by

Maryam Ghodrati

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Rachel Dale

Brandeis University

Series in Sociology



Copyright © 2024 by the Authors.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Vernon Art and Science Inc.

www.vernonpress.com

In the Americas: Vernon Press 1000 N West Street, Suite 1200 Wilmington, Delaware, 19801 United States In the rest of the world: Vernon Press C/Sancti Espiritu 17, Malaga, 29006 Spain

Series in Sociology

Library of Congress Control Number: 2023950781

ISBN: 978-1-64889-824-2

Product and company names mentioned in this work are the trademarks of their respective owners. While every care has been taken in preparing this work, neither the authors nor Vernon Art and Science Inc. may be held responsible for any loss or damage caused or alleged to be caused directly or indirectly by the information contained in it.

Every effort has been made to trace all copyright holders, but if any have been inadvertently overlooked the publisher will be pleased to include any necessary credits in any subsequent reprint or edition.

Cover design by Vernon Press. Image by Minoo Emami, US, 2008, Copyright the Artist.

Content Warning:

Due to the sensitive nature of the topics addressed in this collection, there are references and images that some readers might find disturbing. Please use your discretion as you proceed.

Table of Contents

	List of Figures	vii
	Introduction	ix
	Maryam Ghodrati University of Massachusetts Amherst	
	Rachel Dale Brandeis University	
Chapter 1	Embodied Testimonies: Institutional Ecstasy, Individual Agony, and Visual Representation of the Body at War	1
	Maryam Ghodrati University of Massachusetts Amherst	
Chapter 2	Regarding the Pain of Women: Gender and the Arts of Holocaust Memory	49
	James E. Young University of Massachusetts Amherst	
Chapter 3	Refuge in the Imaginary: War Trauma and the Limits of Language in Ghada Samman's <i>Kawābīs</i> <i>Beirut</i> and Samar Yazbek's <i>Planet of Clay</i>	69
	Layla AlAmmar American University of Kuwait (AUK)	
Chapter 4	Speaking Trauma from within Catastrophe: Re-scripting Psychoanalysis in <i>The Search</i> for Walid Masoud	91
	Nora E. H. Parr University of Birmingham	
Chapter 5	Messianic Remnants and Beasts of the Southern Wild	113
	Concetta Principe Trent University	
	Contributors	131
	Acknowledgments	135
	Index	137

List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Guernica. "Mural del Guernica de Picasso" (Mosaical Reproduction of Guernica by Pablo Picasso, 1937, oil painting), mosaic tiles, Guernica, Spain.	8
Figure 1.2	Sacrifice. Kazem Chalipa, 1981.	16
Figure 1.3	Resistance. Kazem Chalipa, 1983.	17
Figure 1.4	Desert Kazem Chalipa, 1984.	18
Figure 1.5	"What Courage!" Francisco Goya, Plate 7 of <i>The Disasters of War</i> , 1810.	19
Figure 1.6	"The Way is Hard!" Francisco Goya, Plate 14 of <i>The Disasters of War</i> , ca. 1810.	20
Figure 1.7	"Desire," John Halaka, #18, Ghosts of Presence/Bodies of Absence, 2016.	27
Figure 1.8	"If Headless Figures Could Talk #3" John Halaka, Remember to Forget, 1993.	27
Figure 1.9	<i>Untitled</i> [taken in Baneh], Mehdi Monem, 2001, photograph. <i>War Victims</i> , 2009.	37
Figure 1.10	<i>Untitled</i> [taken in Isfahan], Mehdi Monem, 2008, photograph. <i>War Victims</i> , 2009.	39
Figure 1.11	"Monument to Victims of Chemical Weapons Unveiled at OPCW Headquarters in the Hague." <i>The Organization</i> for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons, 28 November 2012.	41
Figure 1.12	<i>Untitled</i> [taken in Sar-e Pol-e Zahab], Mehdi Monem, 2007, photograph. <i>War Victims</i> , 2009.	42
Figure 1.13	<i>Untitled</i> [taken in Kermanshah], Mehdi Monem, 2001, photograph. <i>War Victims</i> , 2009.	43
Figure 1.14	War Painting #15, Minoo Emami, War Collection, painting, ca. 2008s.	44

viii List of Figures

Figure 2.1	The execution by hanging of Masha Bruskina and Volodya Sherbateyvich.	51
Figure 2.2	Iconic image of woman and child being shot by SS gunman in Ivanhorod, Ukraine, 1942.	57
Figure 2.3	Jewish women and children from Mizocz, German- occupied Poland, lined up by the SS moments before they were shot, October 14, 1942.	60
Figure 2.4	Boy with hand raised in the Warsaw Ghetto.	62

Introduction

Maryam Ghodrati

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Rachel Dale

Brandeis University

As a new clinical student, Arthur Kleinman vividly recalls an emotionally charged incident in his book *The Illness Narratives: Suffering, Healing, and the Human Condition*. The patient was a misfortunate seven-year-old girl who had suffered extensive burns over most of her body. Her treatment involved the daily torment of a whirlpool bath, during which the medical team meticulously tweezed away the burnt flesh from her raw wounds. This excruciating routine was marked by the girl's screams, moans, and desperate pleas for the medical team to halt the painful procedure. Kleinman's responsibility was to hold her uninjured hand, offering her solace, while also assisting the surgical resident in swiftly removing the dead and infected tissue from her fragile body in the water, which gradually transformed from a pinkish to bloody red hue.

In an attempt to distract the young patient from her traumatic encounters with intense pain, Kleinman engaged her in conversations about her home, family, and school. He found it difficult to bear witness to the daily horrors, including the girl's piercing screams, the sight of dead tissue floating in the blood-stained water, the peeling flesh, the oozing wounds, and the ongoing struggles involved in the cleaning and bandaging process. However, one day, out of desperation and a sense of helplessness, Kleinman implored the girl to share her experiences and how she managed to endure the agonizing burns and the repetitive surgical ritual. To Kleinman's astonishment, the girl paused, her disfigured face making it challenging to discern her expression, but then proceeded to explain straightforwardly and directly. As she narrated her experiences, she held onto Kleinman's hand firmly, no longer screaming or resisting the surgeon or the nurse. As their bond grew strong and trust was established, the girl took it upon herself to share her experiences every day, enabling the student to develop a deeper comprehension. By the time the

x Introduction

student's training in the rehabilitation unit concluded, a noticeable improvement was observed in the girl's ability to tolerate the debridement process.¹

The opening anecdote in Kleinman's narrative and its subsequent exploration in this collection serve as a compelling theoretical testing ground. The memory of the excruciating event, which involved the young girl being badly burned, and its harrowing aftermath, regardless of the underlying context in which this event occurred, becomes the young girl's sole means of establishing a fragile connection with the outside world. Paradoxically, the well-intentioned efforts of the medical team to divert and distract inadvertently exacerbate her isolation and intensify her suffering. The example of the young girl underscores fundamental concepts and areas of contention within trauma theory, particularly the notion that trauma eludes effective expression through language and the deep sense of isolation and alienation it induces.

The girl's traumatic experience resonates with two fundamental hypotheses that have shaped the theoretical foundation for this collection and have perhaps given rise to deconstructivist trauma theory that, consequently, has been critically examined by postcolonial trauma theorists. One hypothesis, proposed by Elaine Scarry, posits that physical pain eludes linguistic capture, relegating those in pain to an "invisible geography" where their cries reverberate like "intergalactic screams" for those who bear witness. The second hypothesis this anecdote brings into focus is Cathy Caruth's notion of unassimilated experiences of trauma. Here, the girl's memory and ongoing suffering exemplify the enduring impact of the traumatic event on her body and psyche, corresponding to both Scarry's notion of physical and Caruth's assertion of psychological pain's resistance to language.

This collection of articles is committed to exploring the confluence of pluralist/postcolonial critique and deconstructivist psychoanalysis, which represent the two primary theoretical frameworks for understanding traumatic experiences and their representation. Through this exploration, the collection aims to illuminate the limitations observed in non-Western portrayals of traumatic history while also addressing the complicity of Western colonial and imperial powers in perpetuating human suffering. By emphasizing the unspeakable experiences of individuals as the foundation for collective and socio-political engagement, the book challenges established postcolonial trauma theory. Such theory often places excessive emphasis on the collective nature of traumatic experiences, submerging individual narratives beneath ideological constructs of nationalism and self-determination. However, it is important to acknowledge the imperative of decolonizing trauma studies by

¹ Arthur Kleinman, The Illness Narratives: Suffering, Healing, and the Human Condition (New York: Basic Books, 1989), xi-xii.

Introduction xi

examining the social and political factors that contribute to these individual experiences of trauma, particularly in relation to gender, in favor of dominant narratives and power structures.

Elaine Scarry, who has written extensively on topics such as beauty, pain, war, and the body, explores - in her 1985 influential work The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World – the nature of physical pain and its social, cultural, and political implications. She has suggested that if one were to consider the range of emotional, perceptual, and somatic experiences associated with various objects or states, the list would be extensive. However, this list would come to an abrupt halt when encountering physical pain. Unlike other conscious experiences, physical pain lacks referential content and does not pertain to or signify anything external. It is precisely because physical pain cannot be objectified outside of the human body that it resists linguistic expression more strongly than any other phenomenon. Its elusive nature and inability to be fully conveyed through words make it uniquely challenging to articulate. Pain, as Scarry asserts, not only resists language but "actively destroys it." 2 Its resistance to objectification leaves persons in pain, deprived of the resources of speech. Pain that occurs in other people's bodies "flicker before the mind, then disappear," making this "absolute split between one's sense of one's reality and the reality of another person."3

The story of the young girl under the care of a medical team, however, extends beyond the realm of physical trauma to encompass the memory of an event, highlighting the complex nature of her experience. Furthermore, this is why Scarry's profound insights into the limitations of language when confronted with physical pain find a compelling resonance in the work of the prominent literary trauma theorist Cathy Caruth. In her seminal work *Unclaimed Experience*: Trauma, Narrative, and History, Caruth delves into a similar challenge of comprehending and representing traumatic experiences, albeit with a focus on psychological trauma. She emphasizes the inherent difficulty in truly listening, knowing and capturing the essence of such crises. Drawing parallels to Scarry's argument on the resistance of pain to linguistic expression, Caruth acknowledges the elusive nature of trauma, which disrupts conventional narrative structures and eludes easy comprehension. She posits that the language employed to address psychological crises often assumes a literary quality, one that defies our understanding even as it seeks to convey the depths of trauma. Caruth's exploration of trauma and its impact on storytelling enriches our understanding of the girl's incommunicable pain and the difficulties encountered by Kleinman

² Elaine Scarry, The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), 4.

³ Ibid., 3.

xii Introduction

and the medical team in truly apprehending her experience. It illuminates a fundamental challenge that emerges when striving to engage with and comprehend traumatic encounters.

Caruth's proposition that this language "defies, even as it claims, our understanding"⁴ finds support in the psychoanalytic hypothesis put forth by the prominent psychiatrist of the late nineteenth century, Pierre Janet. According to Janet, there is a distinction between normal memory, which involves the act of constructing a coherent narrative, and traumatic memory, which manifests as a frozen fixation on an event that has not yet been comprehended and sorted as a linear and meaningful story. Normal memory, much like other psychological phenomena, is an active process specifically characterized by the act of narrating a story, as Janet explains. Its resolution is not complete until we achieve not only an outward response through our actions but also an internal response through the words, we speak to ourselves and the organization of the narrative we recount to others. It is through the integration of this recital into our personal history that a situation can be satisfactorily resolved. Therefore, strictly speaking, an individual who clings to a fixed idea of an event cannot be considered to possess a "memory" in the true sense. The term "traumatic memory" is used merely for "convenience."5

Drawing upon the psychoanalytic differentiation of normal memory and traumatic memory, Geoffrey Hartman's theoretical insights provide a deeper understanding of the intricate interplay between language and trauma within the realm of literary theory. According to Hartman, trauma theory focuses on the "relationship of words and trauma," helping us to "read the wound" with the aid of literature. In an insightful observation, he states that there is "always a disjunction between experience and understanding of it" and that "literary theory/knowledge finds the 'real,' identifies with it, and attempts to bring it back [into focus]. The language of this literary construction of trauma is not literal; it is a different sort of statement that relates to that negative moment in experience that cannot be or has not been adequately experienced." This definition sheds light on that moment of the extreme, the shock of a loss, witnessing a brutal blow, and extreme pain that defeats tolerance, comprehension, and, therefore, language. There is a reality that trauma and literary theory have helped to identify: a moment of experience "experienced"

⁴ Cathy Caruth, Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996), 5.

 $^{^{\}rm 5}$ Pierre Janet quoted in Judith Herman, Trauma and Recovery: The Aftermath of Violence

⁻ From Domestic Abuse to Political Terror (New York: Basic Books, 1997), 35.

⁶ Geoffrey H. Hartman, "On Traumatic Knowledge and Literary Studies," New Literary History 26, no. 3 (1995): 540.

Introduction xiii

too soon and too unexpectedly,"⁷ as Cathy Caruth states before the subject is there to receive it consciously.

The concept of incommunicability and unspeakability surrounding traumatic experiences, as well as the challenges in comprehending the events and their aftermath for both the listener and the witness, has been closely linked to the deconstructivist Yale school of thought. Emerging in the 1990s, trauma theory drew upon Freudian concepts of repression, dissociation, disruption, and repetition compulsion. Pioneered by scholars such as Cathy Caruth, Shoshana Felman, and Geoffrey Hartman, these post-structuralist thinkers employed deconstructionist theory to examine trauma and its representation. Central to their investigations was the identification of dissociative symptoms experienced universally by trauma survivors. Caruth posited that trauma constituted an insoluble problem of the unconscious, exposing inherent contradictions within both experience and language.8 This dissociation of consciousness arises from the terror and surprise encountered during specific events, rendering meaningful recollection and the normal integration of the original experience unattainable for the subject. The delayed nature of reflection, recurrence of symptoms, and reliving of the experience, among other manifestations, stem directly from the absence of consciousness at the moment of the traumatic event. This neurobiological and psychological response elucidates the sufferer's inability to comprehend and articulate their experience, leading to belated recollections that indirectly and somewhat distortedly recall the past.

Caruth and Hartman offer a framework for understanding history through an examination of delayed responses and "other intrusive phenomena." They argue that exploring the manifestations of trauma in victims enables us to grasp the implications of trauma for the individual and contextualize it within the surrounding historical backdrop. Caruth perceives the testimonies of victims and survivors as markers of trauma's effects, serving as acts of "departure," signifying the act of walking away, surviving, and managing the repercussions of the experience. At the core of a trauma narrative, Caruth argues, there resides a form of dual storytelling characterized by the oscillation between a crisis of death and the corresponding crisis of life. It involves recounting the unbearable nature of the event itself alongside the equally unbearable nature of its survival. This inherent doubleness contributes to the literary nature of

⁷ Caruth, Unclaimed Experience, 101.

⁸ Michelle Balaev, Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory (New York: Palgrave, 2014), 1.

⁹ Caruth, Unclaimed Experience, 11.

¹⁰ Ibid., 7.

xiv Introduction

trauma discourse, reflecting the challenge of expressing not merely what occurred but rather how it was felt.

Contrasting the prevailing poststructuralist perspectives on trauma, Michael Balaev offers a more nuanced and pragmatic stance by challenging the asocial and apolitical nature of deconstructivist theories. While scholars like Caruth perceive trauma as an unsolvable issue rooted in the unconscious, Balaev raises concerns regarding the depiction of the past as a void for trauma sufferers and the ambiguity of language referencing absence. Balaev's viewpoint aligns with that of postcolonial critics, including Laurie Vickroy, Kali Tal, Stef Craps, Irene Visser, and clinical practitioner Judith Herman, who emphasize the social, cultural, and political particularities of traumatic experiences. They argue against the Caruthian perspective, which they believe portrays trauma victims as devoid of autonomy and agency, thereby negating the potential for understanding history through trauma narratives.

In their critique of poststructuralist approaches to trauma narratives, Balaev asserts that the meaning of trauma can be located rather than permanently lost, as it is intertwined with larger social, political, and economic practices that influence violence. Similarly, Herman and Vickroy propose that trauma is socially induced, and they highlight the empirical foundations of trauma, including the ongoing connections to "global political movements for human rights" that facilitate the ability to articulate the inexpressible. By challenging the decontextualized view of trauma, these scholars shed light on the social dimensions of traumatic experiences, emphasizing the significance of historical and political contexts. Their perspectives offer an alternative lens through which to examine trauma narratives, acknowledging the interconnectedness between personal experiences and broader socio-political forces.

In her groundbreaking 2015 article titled "Decolonizing Trauma Theory: Retrospect and Prospects," Irene Visser examines the emergence of a new wave in trauma studies. She argues for the development of a decolonized trauma theory in response to the influential special issue of Studies in the Novel published in Spring/Summer 2008. This special issue, edited by Gert Buelens and Stef Craps, focuses on decolonizing trauma theory and emphasizes the importance of including non-Western and non-European experiences, such as racism and the ongoing everyday suffering of marginalized groups. 14 Visser's

¹¹ Balaev, Contemporary Approaches, 1.

¹² Ibid., 8.

¹³ Herman, Trauma and Recovery; Laurie Vickroy, Trauma and Survival in Contemporary Fiction (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2002).

 $^{^{14}}$ Irene Visser, "Decolonizing Trauma Theory: Retrospect and Prospects," Humanities 4, no. 2 (2015): 250.

Introduction XV

abstract highlights the need for an inclusive approach to trauma that incorporates non-Western belief systems, rituals, and ceremonies. She asserts that embracing these cultural perspectives is essential to achieving the remaining objectives of the long-standing project of decolonizing trauma theory. 15 Quoting Craps, Visser points out that trauma studies must take into account social and historical relations and situate the traumatic histories of subordinate groups within the broader context of socially dominant groups.¹⁶

Drawing from Luckhurst's critique, Visser examines Caruth's Freudian perspective on trauma, which tends to focus on the lasting effects of trauma and the maintenance of the post-traumatic condition. ¹⁷ Visser suggests that Dominick LaCapra's work provides steps toward overcoming the ahistorical grip of Freudian/Caruthian trauma theory. LaCapra challenges the notion that melancholia and fragility are defining and unchangeable characteristics of the post-traumatic stage. Instead, he emphasizes the importance of strengthening communal and individual identities to counteract the lasting effects of trauma. 18 Visser concludes that contemporary postcolonial studies recognize trauma as a complex phenomenon, extending beyond individual, acute events to encompass collective and chronic experiences. "Trauma can weaken individuals and communities, but it can also lead to a stronger sense of identity and renewed social cohesion."19 Among those traumatic histories of subordinate groups that Visser wants to bring into the broader context of socially dominant groups are the experiences of racially differentiated women.

Pain and suffering are universal experiences, but the afterlife or memory of traumatic events differ for survivors according to their social position; women, ethnic or racial minorities, refugees, and people living in poverty are not afforded the same levels of understanding and protection that are granted to survivors with more social capital. The compounding impacts of gender and race for the women represented in this collection mean that their pain is too often overlooked in accounts of war and displacement. More importantly, it also reveals the ways in which their trauma is objectified or co-opted into larger national or religious narratives of suffering.²⁰ As the authors in this collection

¹⁵ Ibid., 250.

¹⁶ Ibid., 253.

¹⁷ Ibid., 254.

¹⁸ Ibid., 254.

¹⁹ Ibid., 263.

²⁰ Although there is currently very little English-language scholarship on Arab and West Asian women's experiences of trauma, there is a growing body of research that addresses gendered pain in other postcolonial contexts. For instance, Zoë Norridge's Perceiving Pain in African Literature, Antjie Krog's There Was This Goat, and Pumla Gobodo-Madikizela's A Human Being Died that Night all explore specific forms of violence against women in the

xvi Introduction

have pointed out, non-Western women's pain is rarely allowed to exist. Instead, it is twisted into a symbolic representation of patriotic duty, sexual desire, or the object of masculine "protection." In these cases, any potential for individual resistance or recovery is overshadowed by the political exigency of a particular narrative. However, the impulse to resist narrative subsumption is still evident in women's testimonies of their individual traumas, and it is a social and political imperative to unearth their experiences and refute the symbolic potential that others attempt to impose upon them.

Numerous theorists, including Judith Herman, contend that psychoanalytic understandings of trauma, particularly those put forth by Freud and his followers, gradually veered away from reality. According to Herman, "psychoanalysis became a study of the internal vicissitudes of fantasy and desire, dissociated from the reality of experience." However, Geoffrey Hartman offers a nuanced psychoanalytic elucidation of the "real," which proves particularly valuable in the ongoing debate and our exploration of literary and artistic representations of trauma and post-traumatic suffering within this collection.

Hartman employs Lacan's concept of the real to illustrate that Freud did not entirely disregard empirical reality; rather, he pointed to the existence of a distinct form of reality. Hartman explains that "the real is not the real, in the sense of a specific, identifiable thing or cause; however specific it may be, it is also a burning idea or its own 'wake' of desire." ²² In relation to the representation of trauma explored in this collection, the real can be found" within the world of 'death-feelings, lost objects, and drives." ²³ This approach is particularly valuable in highlighting that the specific moment of "unmediated shock" and the subsequent inner turmoil, overflow of emotions, recurring imagery and memories, or the agonizing longing for the departed loved one is no less real than external, identifiable causes. In these instances, the real is simply that which eludes linguistic elaboration, even though its historical origins can be traced, and it can be diagnosed based on its physical symptoms. For instance, the intense desire for death experienced by a female victim of the Iran-Iraq war is explored in the first chapter in the wake of her excruciating pain.

Hartman asserts that this understanding of the real leads us towards literary theory, as "the disjunction between experiencing (phenomenal or empirical)

African context, while Kaiama L. Glover's A Regarded Self interrogates the narratives of women's pain and resistance in Caribbean literature and Urvashi Butalia's The Other Side of Silence covers the traumatic history of India's partition in 1947. For a more comprehensive and comparative analysis of women, literature, and trauma around the world, we recommend checking out Trauma and Literature, edited by J. Roger Kurtz.

²¹ Herman, Trauma and Recovery, 14.

²² Hartman, "On Traumatic Knowledge," 539.

²³ Ibid., 539.

Introduction xvii

and understanding (thoughtful naming, in which words replace things, or their images) is what figurative language expresses and explores." ²⁴ Despite Dominick LaCapra's critique of their post-structuralist approach, he shares a common ground with Caruth and Hartman in emphasizing the disconcerting and irresolvable impact of trauma on the victim. This shared viewpoint makes their arguments deserving of attention, especially in the context of colonialism's wounds and the suffering endured by non-white populations.

In order to begin to understand the full impact of suffering in literary and artistic representation, trauma theory must account for both concepts of the Real: the deconstructionists' emphasis on the failure of language and the power of the unconscious in naming trauma, and the postcolonial trauma theorists' emphasis on the historical-material conditions that produce the context in which trauma occurs. When analyzed together, these two seemingly disparate approaches produce a more nuanced version of traumatic totality—one that begins to account for individual psychology and collective histories. The following chapters take both perspectives seriously, engaging with the histories of colonialism, racism, and sexism in order to make sense of individual experiences of loss and desire. While each chapter focuses on a unique case study or series of objects, they collectively demonstrate the importance of acknowledging the diversity of experiences and voices in representations of trauma throughout different historical and cultural contexts and offer forms of resistance to easy symbolic interpretation.

The first two chapters focus on the representation of women's experiences of war in contemporary art, which has been dominated by male perspectives, eclipsing women's accounts of their own experiences. The first chapter by Maryam Ghodrati delves into the embodiment of testimonies from the Iran-Iraq War, capturing both the institutional ecstasy felt by those in power and the individual agony endured by the survivors. Building upon Rothberg's concept of traumatic realism, Ghodrati specifically focuses on visual representations of trauma in the aftermath of the Iran-Iraq War, taking into account their gendered dimensions. She examines how these representations reveal the interconnectedness of bodies, state conventions, and national concerns, shedding light on the gendered consequences that arise in the wake of violence. By embracing a multidirectional memory and adopting a traumatic realist approach, this chapter explicitly challenges the tendency of postcolonial trauma theory to prioritize collective experiences and overlook individual narratives. According to Ghodrati, art acts as a challenge to dominant narratives of war and nation, inspiring critical engagement with women's attempts to reclaim their stories from subsumption into nationalist ideology.

²⁴ Ibid., 540.

xviii Introduction

Similarly, James Young's analysis of artistic depictions of women in the Holocaust (Chapter 2) emphasizes the need for gender-sensitive approaches to memory and experiences of trauma. However, unlike Ghodrati, Young's argument focuses on how art that represents women's experiences disregards or even negates the desires of its subjects. He points out that visual and literary depictions of Jewish women's suffering during the Holocaust often tend to objectify women's bodies and obfuscate their psychological pain and voices. Employing Susan Sontag's work on photography and pain alongside the large body of literature that explores gender and Holocaust memory, Young argues that the public gaze of photographers, curators, historians, and museumgoers continues to turn women into objects of memory, idealized casts of perfect suffering and victimization, and emblems of larger Jewish suffering during the Holocaust. The result of the interaction between artist, viewer, and subject means that even though women's pain is often held in high regard, it is also made a spectacle-converting the individual's suffering into cultural and even psychological objects full of symbolism.

The third and fourth chapters shift the focus away from visual art and focus instead on representations of Palestinian women's trauma in literature. These works explore how a retreat into the Lacanian concept of the Imaginary offers a sense of liberation, or at least resistance, to colonial frameworks of violence and control. Layla AlAmmar's chapter (Chapter 3) argues that the female protagonists of Ghada Samman's Kawābīs Beirut and Samar Yazbek's Planet of Clay react to the utter breakdown of their social realities by retreating into the fantasy-laden, visual field of the Imaginary. Both protagonists narrate their stories under conditions of escalating violence as the Lebanese Civil War and the Syrian Civil War, respectively, erupt around them. Consequently, they evince axiomatic aesthetics of trauma, such as compulsive repetitions and silence, which revert to Freudian understandings of trauma. However, by drawing on Jacques Lacan's register of orders, the analysis shifts from an individual, pathologizing view of the protagonists to the wider psychosocial implications of how the respective wars have ruptured the Symbolic and revealed the traumatic Real, which AlAmmar argues manifests as neopatriarchal hegemonic structures which continually generate war paradigms. In both narratives, a semiotic, pre-symbolic dimension allows the protagonists to articulate trauma in a way that eschews the violent discourse of men. However, despite finding some refuge in the Imaginary, both are ultimately made to confront the Symbolic. This reading of Samman and Yazbek's works challenges the "unspeakable" paradigm of trauma theory while simultaneously attending to individual experience and consciousness within systems of social hegemony.

Nora Parr, on the other hand, focuses her analysis in Chapter 4 on the relationship between individual trauma and the larger experience of Palestinians

Introduction xix

who have been displaced. She takes the position that the understanding of trauma cannot be universalized, but the language associated with it can be productively used—and manipulated—for decolonial purposes. Parr argues that Jabra Ibrahim Jabra's novel *The Search for Walid Masoud* rejects the "working through or sense" — making goals of trauma theory by introducing terms of psychoanalysis, creating a critical distance from them, and ultimately transforming the vocabulary of trauma to fashion a unique schema of meaning that is symbolically valuable and unique to a particular community of Palestinian emigrants in Baghdad. Parr claims that though the novel offers no explicit or universal definition of trauma and refuses to address whether or not it can be fully decolonized, Jabra's work does suggest that psychoanalysis and trauma theory can, and have been, re-deployed by postcolonial authors to resist Western influence and hegemony.

The fifth and final chapter returns to the issue of traumatic representation and witnessing by problematizing Benh Zeitlin's portrayal of the gendered and racialized messianic figure in his 2012 film Beasts of the Southern Wild. Concetta Principe argues that the putative Black savior fantasy on screen is riddled with the white American trauma that sustains America's racist history despite its hopeful message and seeming subversion of expectations. Using Lacan's understanding of the Real and Agamben's concept of the "messianic remnant," Principe asks the question: whose trauma is being represented? Like Young's claim that visual art has failed to fully represent Jewish women's traumatic experiences in the Holocaust, Principe argues that Zeitlin's film and Doris Betts' short story struggle to account for the racial trauma of Black Americans, ultimately projecting a fantasy that attempts to assuage the guilt and frustration of white Americans instead. Her framework begs the audience to think critically about the social and political impact of traumatic representation, rejecting a simplistic association between the experiences of a specific subject and the trauma of the community at large.

Taken together, these chapters engage with issues of universality and specificity; they show that there is not one easy way to strike a balance between deconstructivist ideas about trauma and postcolonial or pluralist approaches. The authors in this collection demonstrate the necessity of embracing a dynamic and diverse approach to the representation of trauma that makes marginalized survivors visible while also recognizing the complexities of gendered and racialized experiences of trauma. By analyzing marginalized representations of trauma, the work in this collection establishes connections and methods for reading trauma within (and against) both the deconstructivist and postcolonial paradigms of trauma theory. Connecting the values of postcolonial and deconstructionist trauma theory is of particular importance in a globalized world, where the legacies of colonialism continue to impact

xx Introduction

societies and cultures in complex ways—affecting individuals and communities. Rather than pitting them against one another, this volume presents diverse methods for how these approaches can inform and strengthen one another.

Bibliography

- Balaev, Michelle. *Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.
- Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996.
- Hartman, Geoffrey H. "On Traumatic Knowledge and Literary Studies." *New Literary History* 26, no. 3, 1995: 537–563.
- Herman, Judith. *Trauma and Recovery: The Aftermath of Violence—From Domestic Abuse to Political Terror.* New York: Basic Books, 1997.
- Kleinman, Arthur. *The Illness Narratives: Suffering, Healing, and the Human Condition.* New York: Basic Books, 1989.
- Scarry, Elaine. *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Vickroy, Laurie. *Trauma and Survival in Contemporary Fiction*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2002.
- Visser, Irene. "Decolonizing Trauma Theory; Retrospect and Prospects." *Humanities* 4, no. 2, 2015: 250–265.

Further Reading

- Adorno, Theodor W. (auth.) and Robert Hullot-Kentor (ed. and trans.). *Aesthetic Theory*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1998.
- Adorno, Theodor W. (auth.) and E.F.N. Jephcott (trans.). *Minima Moralia: Reflections from Damaged Life.* New York: Verso, 2020.
- LaCapra, Dominick. *Writing History, Writing Trauma*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.

PAGES MISSING FROM THIS FREE SAMPLE

Contributors

Layla AlAmmar

Layla AlAmmar is a writer from Kuwait with a PhD in Arab women's fiction and literary trauma theory. She received a Master's degree in Creative Writing from the University of Edinburgh and has published two novels. She has written journal articles on the fiction of Adania Shibli as well as the collection Palestine +100, and she is currently co-editing a special issue, *Wombs and Tombs: Hauntings and Generational Trauma in Arab Women's Writing.*

Rachel Dale

Rachel Dale holds a Master's degree in English from Brandeis University (2020) and is currently pursuing a Ph.D. in contemporary global Anglophone literature at the same institution. Concurrently, she teaches trauma treatment and PTSD at the Van Loan School of Professional Studies at Endicott College. Her dissertation examines the detrimental effects of internationally funded industrial and economic development projects, drawing on the perspectives of contemporary realist authors like Arundhati Roy, Amitav Ghosh, and NoViolet Bulawayo, among others. She has been awarded several fellowships and grants, including the Shirle Dorothy Robbins Creative Writing Prize in 2021.

Maryam Ghodrati

Maryam Ghodrati holds a Ph.D. in Comparative Literature from the University of Massachusetts Amherst and currently serves as Affiliated Faculty at Emerson College in Boston. Her research encompasses trauma studies, literary theory, women's studies, film studies, and contemporary Middle Eastern and diaspora studies. She teaches courses on trauma in creative imagination, body politics, literature and social justice, and gender and sexuality in global literature. Her translations of war poetry have been featured in a special issue titled "Casualty" in *The Massachusetts Review*. Her article, titled "Narrative Materialization of Traumatic Memory" is under review for publication in a 2024 special issue of Iranian Studies by Cambridge University Press.

Nora E. H. Parr

Nora Parr is a research fellow at the University of Birmingham and the Center for Lebanese Studies. She is a co-investigator on the Rights for Time research network and a co-editor of *Middle Eastern Literature*. She is the author of the *Novel Palestine: Nation through the Works of Ibrahim Nasrallah* (University of California Press, 2023).

132 Contributors

Concetta Principe

Concetta Principe's current scholarship focuses on the relationship between culture and madness from a Lacanian perspective. Her article, "Authorial Rights and the Cultural Economy of Madness," was published in 2022 in *Psychoanalytische Perspectieven*. She is co-editor of *From Cogito to Covid: A Rethinking of Lacan's "Science and Truth"* (Palgrave MacMillan, 2022) and author of a chapter in *From Cogito to Covid*, "The Truth of Lacan's Name of the Father: A Reconsiderati on of the 'truth' in 'Science and Truth.'" Her research has appeared in *Psychoanalysis, Culture and Society, Psychoanalytic Discourse/ Discours Psychoanalytique, Journal of Cultural Research* and *The Bible and Critical Theory.* Alongside her scholarly publications, she is a peer reviewer for *Religion and Literature, English Studies in Canada*, and *Topia*. She is a member of the Equity Committee at Trent University in Durham, Canada, where she is an Assistant Professor teaching literature and writing studies.

James E. Young

James E. Young is Distinguished University Professor of English and Judaic Studies Emeritus at the University of Massachusetts Amherst and the Founding Director of the Institute for Holocaust, Genocide, and Memory Studies at UMass Amherst. Young has also taught at New York University as a Dorot Professor of English and Hebrew/Judaic Studies (1984-88), at Bryn Mawr College in the History of Religion, and the University of Washington, Harvard University, and Princeton University as a visiting professor. He received his Ph.D. from the University of California Santa Cruz in 1983. He is the author of Writing and Rewriting the Holocaust (Indiana University Press, 1988), The Texture of Memory (Yale University Press, 1993), which won the National Jewish Book Award in 1994, At Memory's Edge: After-images of the Holocaust in Contemporary Art and Architecture (Yale University Press, 2000), and The Stages of Memory: Reflections on Memorial Art, Loss, and the Spaces Between (University of Massachusetts Press, 2016), which won the National Council for Public History Book Award for 2017. He was also the Guest Curator of an exhibition at the Jewish Museum in New York City, entitled "The Art of Memory: Holocaust Memorials in History" (March - August 1994, with venues in Berlin and Munich, September 1994 - June 1995) and was the editor of The Art of Memory (Prestel Verlag, 1994), the exhibition catalog for this show. In 1997, Professor Young was appointed by the Berlin Senate to the five-member Findungskommission for Germany's national "Memorial to Europe's Murdered Jews," which selected Peter Eisenman's design, finished and dedicated in May 2005. More recently, he was appointed to the jury for the "National 9/11 Memorial" design competition, won by Michael Arad and Peter Walker in 2004 and opened on September 11th, 2011. Professor Young has written widely on public art, memorials, and national memory. His articles, reviews, and Op-Ed Contributors 133

essays have appeared in *The New York Times* Magazine, Book Review, and Op-Ed pages, *The Los Angeles Times, The Chicago Tribune, The Forward,* and *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung,* among other newspapers, as well as in scholarly journals such as *Critical Inquiry, Representations, New Literary History, PMLA, Partisan Review, The Yale Journal of Criticism, Annales, SAQ, History and Theory, Harvard Design Magazine, Jewish Social Studies, Contemporary Literature, History and Memory, The Chronicle of Higher Education, Holocaust and Genocide Studies, Prooftexts, The Jewish Quarterly, <i>Tikkun,* and *Slate,* among dozens of other journals and collected volumes. His books and articles have been published in German, French, Hebrew, Japanese, and Swedish editions. Professor Young is the recipient of numerous awards and fellowships, including a Guggenheim Fellowship, ACLS Fellowship, NEH Exhibition planning, implementation, and research grants, Memorial Foundation for Jewish Culture Grants, an American Philosophical Society Grant, and a Yad Hanadiv Fellowship at the Hebrew University in Jerusalem, among others.

Acknowledgments

As the editors of *Embodied Testimonies, Gendered Memories, and the Poetics of Trauma,* we would like to extend our profound gratitude to the following individuals and groups whose support and contributions were invaluable in making this book a reality:

The amazing authors, Dr. James Young, Dr. Layla AlAmmar, Dr. Nora Parr, and Dr. Concetta Principe, for sharing their research with us and for their patience and trust throughout the process.

The editorial staff at Vernon Press – especially Irene Benavides, Blanca Caro Duran, and Argiris Legatos – for their assistance and direction as we have been working on this collection.

Dr. Moira Inghilleri, Professor of Translation and Interpreting Studies and Comparative Literature and Director of the UMass Cornerstone Initiative at the University of Massachusetts Amherst, for her invaluable guidance and feedback.

Samantha Whittle, Dr. Ghodatri's diligent research assistant and a graduate student of Comparative Literature at the University of Massachusetts Amherst, for her meticulous attention to detail and dedication to this project.

Dr. Amir Barati of Texas Tech University, thank you for your insightful contribution to the conference proposal that inspired this collection.

John Halaka, visual artist, documentary filmmaker, and Professor of Visual Arts at the University of San Diego in California, graciously shared his valuable time to engage in several insightful and illuminating conversations about art's role in resistance to political oppression within colonized and diaspora communities.

Minoo Emami, a multidisciplinary artist whose artistic endeavors have bridged the gap between art and advocacy, graciously shared her art for the cover of this collection.

Dr. Emilie Diouf, Assistant Professor of English at Brandeis University, for her compassionate guidance and feedback.

Dr. Jennifer Ellis West, Associate Professor of English and Director of the Core Rhetoric Seminar at Samford University, for her insights on trauma studies and for modeling the ethic of care and attention that informs this scholarship.

Dr. Dominick Knowles, lecturer at the University of Massachusetts Boston, Poetry Editor at Protean Magazine, and Academic Director at the Clemente Course in the Humanities (Boston), for sharing their expertise regarding the editorial and publication process.

We would also like to extend our gratitude to our incredible families and dedicated partners. Their encouragement and understanding have made this accomplishment possible.

Finally, Ms. H.D., an extraordinary survivor of a devastating chemical attack, offers a poignant and courageous testament to the harsh realities of enduring and surviving the aftermath of such a traumatic event. Through her conversations and introspective diaries, she provides a unique and invaluable perspective on the physical and psychological challenges faced by survivors of war, shedding light on the profound impact of such experiences on an individual's life and the broader human understanding of resilience in the face of extreme adversity.

Index

Α

Agamben, Giorgio. 113-118, 122. Al-Samman, Hanadi. 81-83. Anidjar, Gil. 117. Arendt, Hannah. 126.

B

Bataille, George. 58. Betts, Doris. 122, 125-126. Bialik, Chaim Nachman. 63-65. Bruskina, Marusia. 50-51.

C

Caruth, Cathy. x-xv, 4-5, 29, 35, 38, 69-71. Chalipa, Kazem. 14-18. *Chora.* 81-83.

D

Dix, Otto. 6-7, 22. Dols, Michael. 96.

\mathbf{E}

El Shakry, Omnia. 95-96. Emami, Minoo. 43-44.

F

Fanon, Franz. 12-13, 23. Frank, Anne. 50, 53-54. Frank, Otto. 50, 53-54. Freud, Sigmund. xv-xvi, 71-73, 75-77, 84-86, 93, 95, 99.

G

Global warming. 115, 118-120, 127. Goodarzi Dibaj, Morteza. 10, 23. Goya, Francisco. 7-9, 19-21. Guernica. 5-9.

Η

Halaka, John. 25-29.
Hatamikia, Ebrahim. 34-36.
Holocaust (Shoah / Shoa). 11-12,
18, 24, 33, 38, 49-65, 115-116.
Homo sacer. 122, 127.
hooks, bell. 120-123, 127.
Horowitz, Sara. 62.
Hossein, Imam ibn Ali. 10, 13-15,
22.
Hossein, Zeinab. 14-16.
Hurma. 80.
Hurricane Katrina (2005). 119-120,
126-127.

I

Imaginary. 73, 76, 78, 79-87. Iran-Iraq War (1980-1988). 1-2, 3, 9-15, 16-18, 21-24, 30, 40-45. Islam. 12-15, 21, 31, 41, 80, 95-96, 116-118.

J

Jabra, Jabra Ibrahim. 92-99.

K

Khosrowjerdi, Hussein. 21-22, 35. Kleeblatt, Norman. 61. Kluger, Ruth. 54, 65. 138 Index

Kristeva, Julia. 32, 81-83.

Lurie, Boris. 60-61.

L

Lacan, Jacques. xvi, 73-78, 81-82, 86-87, 114-115, 128.
Lanzmann, Claude. 115.
Lebanese Civil War (1975-1990). 72, 74, 87.
Levi, Primo. 114, 116, 128.
Levinthal. David. 56-59.

M

Makhmalbaf, Mohsen. 30-33, 36. Meari, L. 97-98, 105. messianic remnant. 113-128. Monem, Mehdi. 36-43. *Muselmann*. 113-118, 121-122, 127-128.

Ν

Nakba (1948). 93-94, 102. Negrea, Irinia. 119-120. Neopatriarchy. 73, 76, 78-80, 85, 87. Nomberg-Przytyk, Sarah. 63. Noorani, Yaseen. 80-81.

0

Objet a. 114-115, 127.

P

Palangi, Naser. 16-19.
Paul (Biblical apostle). 115-117.
Picasso, Pablo. 5-8.
Psychoanalysis. x, xvi, xix, 73, 78, 93-98.

R

Rapoport, Nathan. 59.

Richter, Gerhard. 61. Ringelheim, Joan. 53-54, 62, 65. Rothberg, Michael. xvii, 4-5, 11, 24, 33.

S

Sacred Defense (Art of / Cinema of / Revolution of). 10-12, 18-19, 32, 34.

Samman, Ghada. 72-77, 81, 85-87.
Sassoon, Siegfried. 3.
Scarry, Elaine. x-xi, 30-32.
Seikaly, Sherene. 94-95.
Sheehi, Lara and Stephen. 97, 107.
Shields, David. 6.
Slavery. 5, 70, 122, 124-127.
Sontag, Susan. 9, 49-51, 59.
Spiegelman, Art. 54-57, 115.
Symbolic order. 73-76, 79-87.
Syrian Civil War (2011-present). 72,

T

The Disasters of War. 7-9, 19.

V

Verhaeghe, Paul. 85.

W

Wiesel, Eli. 11.

74.

Y

Yad Vashem. 56, 59. Yazbek, Samar. 72, 74, 77, 87. Young, James. 17-18, 38.

\mathbf{Z}

Zeitlin, Benh. 113-114, 118-119